DOCUMENT RESUME

ED 085 126 RC 007 469

AUTHOR Roanhorse, Evelyn Sharl
TITLE Social Welfare Problems of the Navajo Nation; A Perceptual Study of Social Welfare Needs.
PUB DATE May 73
NOTE 95p.; MSW Research Project, Arizona State University, Tempe

EDRS PRICE MF-$0.65 HC-$3.29
DESCRIPTORS Agency Role; *American Indians; Community Influence; Education; Employment; History; Individual Power; Local Government; *Needs; Policy Formation; *Program Improvement; *Services; *Social Welfare
IDENTIFIERS *Navajos

ABSTRACT

The purposes of this study were, first, to identify the ways Navajos have historically met their needs, pointing out ways in which American society has dealt with their social welfare problems, and second, to determine to what extent present day social welfare services have met these needs. The study population consisted of 112 Navajo workers from 32 traditional agencies in Tuba City and Window Rock (Arizona). The respondents' major unmet needs, and their order of importance, were (1) agency supplied needs; (2) survival needs; (3) employment needs; and (4) educational needs. A majority of the respondents felt there were major advantages in a tribal takeover of programs and planning. It was recommended that there be an all out effort to meet and satisfy tribal requirements. Agency cooperation and allowance for Navajo self-determination and input into programs affecting the tribe were also necessities. (KM)

FILMED FROM BEST AVAILABLE COPY

ED 085126

SOCIAL WELFARE

PROBLEMS OF THE NAVAJO NATION:

A PERCEPTUAL STUDY OF SOCIAL WELFARE NEEDS

U.S. DEPARTMENT OF HEALTH, EDUCATION & WELFARE
NATIONAL INSTITUTE OF EDUCATION
THIS DOCUMENT HAS BEEN REPRODUCED EXACTLY AS RECEIVED FROM THE PERSON OR ORGANIZATION ORIGINATING IT. POINTS OF VIEW OR OPINIONS STATED DO NOT NECESSARILY REPRESENT OFFICIAL NATIONAL INSTITUTE OF EDUCATION POSITION OR POLICY

by

Evelyn Sharl Roanhorse

A Research Project Presented in
Partial Fulfillment of the Requirements
For the Degree of Master of Social Work

Arizona State University

May, 1973

RC007469

SOCIAL WELFARE

PROBLEMS OF THE NAVAJO NATION:

A PERCEPTUAL STUDY OF SOCIAL WELFARE NEEDS

by

Evelyn Sharl Roanhorse

has been approved

May, 1973

APPROVED:

E. Donald Polley, Chairman

ACCEPTED:

Horace W. Lundberg

Dean, Graduate School of Social Service Administration

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The writer wishes to express her appreciation to the following respondents for their cooperation and willingness to be interviewed for this study.

Howard Bahe
Tom Tso
Herman Tsosie
Della Thompson
Truman Davis
Betti Begay
Richard Bowman
Raymond Bahe
Alice Curley
Harold Lope
Pauline Yellowhair
Ruby Jones
Nelson L. Begay
Albert Goldtooth
Jimmie Store
Perry Tsosie
Dennie Parker
Ray Mitchell
Frank Isaac, Sr.
Frankie Howard

The writer is also indebted to Ruby Jones, typist for this project, for her competent assistance in making the completion of this study possible.

Last but not least, the writer wishes to express her appreciation to Dr. G. Donald Polenz, faculty advisor, for his interest in the project and for the great amount of time he invested in the advisement process.

ABSTRACT

Problem: The purpose of this study was twofold: First, the intent was to identify the ways the Navajos have met their needs historically, and to point out the ways the Navajos have been dealt with by the American Society and their agencies in relationship to their welfare problems. Secondly, there was an attempt to determine to what extent present day social welfare services were meeting the Navajo needs. The needs identified have been examined in depth under the following unmet need categories: survival, employment, educational and agency supplied needs. Agency policies and problems are also discussed, including the need for Navajo self-determination and input into policy formulation.

Method: The study population consisted of a total of 112 Navajo workers from 32 traditional agencies in the cities of Tuba City and Window Rock, Arizona. The actual sample selected consisted of 20 respondents from 13 of the above agencies. In depth interviews, utilizing openended, predetermined questions, were administered to the 20 respondents around three major areas: (1) the unmet needs of the Navajo clientele of the traditional agencies; (2) Preceptions on the effectiveness of the present service delivery system; (3) workers perceptions on questions of funding, administration, control and program development among the traditional agencies.

Findings: The major unmet needs as defined by the respondents are listed in the following ranked order of importance: (1) agency supplied needs; (2) survival needs; (3) employment needs; (4) educational needs.

Navajo respondents see that non-Navajos are setting agency policy. They feel non-Navajo persons should serve the Navajo mainly in the capacity of consultant, - or not try to "help" at all. Most felt that Navajo opinion does affect agency policy formulations; and yet they are almost evenly divided as to whether grievances can be redressed or not. It was felt that service is hindered because of inter-agency conflict, and that communication needs to be improved among agencies. A majority of respondents felt there were major advantages to a Navajo Tribal Takeover of Navajo related programs and planning.

Improved and new programs are needed on the reservation mainly in the areas of job training and development and improved educational programs. A college education is not seen as necessary for working effectively with the Navajo people. Being Navajo, knowing the Navajo language and having a patient and humanitarian approach are important qualities to have in working effectively with the Navajo people.

The funding of social service programs should primarily be by the Federal government followed by state government sources.

Recommendations:

The main recommendations follow naturally from the findings. There is a desperate necessity of an all out effort to be directed by federal, state, local and tribal efforts to meet and satisfy the unmet needs of the Navajo people that have bound them into poverty for centuries. Agency cooperation and allowance

for Navajo self-determination and input into programs affecting the Navajo people is also a vital necessity. Navajos can work better with their own people as they share the same language and cultural traditions; this should be encouraged whenever possible. The coordinated effort of provision of larger amounts of federal and state funds, and the Navajo tribal takeover would be a start in the right direction of Navajo self-sufficiency. Undergirding it all must be a greater understanding of what it means to be a Navajo.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

PAGE

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS.....iii

ABSTRACT.....iv

LIST OF TABLES.....viii

CHAPTER

I. THE PROBLEM.....1

Introduction.....1
Purpose of the Study.....2
Relevance of the Study.....3
Welfare: It is Many Things.....3
The Need for Training.....4
Theorectical Orientation and Value Position.....4

II. AN OVERVIEW OF NAVAJO WELFARE PROJECTS: A HISTORICAL PERSPECTIVE...6

The Early Navajo.....6
The Need for More Land.....12
Related Welfare Problems.....12
The Decade of the 1930's.....18
The Aftermath of World War II.....22
The Fernandez Amendment.....23
The Long-Range Act.....24
The State's involvement in Navajo Welfare.....26
Recent Navajo Tribal Welfare Activity.....27
Summary.....30

III. METHOD OF STUDY.....31

The Population.....31
Sample Collection.....31
Data Collection Procedure.....32
Biographical Data.....33
Method of Data Analysis.....36
Summary.....36

IV. RESEARCH FINDINGS.....37

Introduction.....37
Unmet Needs.....37
Educational Needs.....37
Employment Needs.....38
Agency Supplied Needs.....38
Operation and Policy Determination of Agencies.....39
Does Navajo Opinion Affect Agency Policy Formulation?.....45
Agencies Administrative Concerns.....46
48

CHAPTER PAGE

Do Jurisdictional and Policy Conflicts affect Provision of Services?....48
Are there Advantages to Navajo Tribal Takeover?....50
What are the Personal Qualities that make a Worker Effective Among the Navajo People?....55
What Should be the Funding Source of Social Services Programs?..58
Summary....59

V. IMPLICATIONS OF THE DATA....60

Introduction....60
Unmet Needs....61
Educational Needs....61
Employment Needs....63
Agency Supplied Needs....66
Summary....67

VI. CULTURAL EXPERIENCES AND THEIR RELEVANCE....68

Introduction....68
Religion....68
Mental Health....69
Employment....70
Legal Services....71
Summary: The Need to Understand....72
A Final Note: To Be A Navajo....74

BIBLIOGRAPHY....79

APPENDICES....80

BIOGRAPHICAL SKETCH....84

LIST OF TABLES

TABLE		PAGE
1.	Sex of Respondents by Agency	33
2.	Age Level of Respondents by Agency	34
3.	Educational Level of Respondents by Agency	34
4.	Length of Time Worked at Present Agency	35
5.	Needs as Seen by Navajo Respondents	37
6.	Greatest or Highest Priority Needs	41
7.	Results of Unmet Physical Needs	41
8.	To Whom do Navajos' turn for Help?	42
9.	Increasing Demand for Social Services	43
10.	Areas Needing Increased Social Services	45
11.	Who Sets Agency Policies?	45
12.	What Areas can Non-Navajos be of Help?	46
13.	Is Navajo Opinion taken into Consideration in Formulation of Agency Policy?	47
14.	Are Expression of Dissatisfaction taken into Consideration in Agency Policy Changes?	47
15.	Does Policy and Jurisdictional Conflict Among Agencies Limit Respondents Ability to Provide Meaningful Service?	48
16.	Solution for Agency Policy and Jurisdictional Conflicts	49
17.	How Some Workers Avoid Policy and Jurisdictional Conflicts Among Agencies	50
18.	Are There Advantages to the Navajo Tribal Takeover?	51
19.	Advantages to Navajo Tribal Takeover	51
20.	Disadvantage to the Navajo Tribal Takeover	52
21.	New Programs Respondents Would Like to see Implemented or Improved	54

TABLE PAGE

22. Is College Education Necessary to Provide Meaningful Service?.....55

23. Personal Qualities a Social Worker should have in Order to relate to and be of Service to Navajos.....56

24. Should Personal Qualities Apply to both Navajo and Non-Navajo Persons?.....57

25. Where should Funds to Operate Social Services Programs come from?..58

Chapter I

THE PROBLEM

Introduction

The subject of this study is the welfare problem on the Navajo reservation. Many of the needs of the Navajo people are not being met by the traditional agencies that have been serving them for years, i.e., State Department of Public Welfare, Bureau of Indian Affairs, Public Health Services and others.

The Navajos or "Dine" as they refer to themselves were conquered by the United States Army in 1864, when they were forced into submission by Kit Carson of New Mexico. The Navajos left their homeland and were settled under military control at Fort Sumner, New Mexico, by the Pecos River. In 1868, a treaty was signed with the Navajos as a sovereign tribe, and more than 8,000 Navajos (out of approximately 16,000) returned to their old homelands, where a reservation was set aside for them in Arizona and New Mexico. A hundred and three years have elapsed since then, and many ways of helping and aiding the Navajos have been tried by the United States government, first under the Department of War, and later under the Department of the Interior. These departments first issued rations and other material goods in kind to the Navajo people until the early 1940's, when the first "welfare" check was issued. Efforts have been made to have the Navajos become self-supporting through an agricultural economy, but due to hardships, i.e., droughts, soil erosion and stock reduction, this did not succeed.

The first moves toward Navajo self-government were made around 1903, when a court of Indian Offense was established; there were three Navajo judges and the Navajo Area Superintendent (Anglo) presided at court hearings. In 1921 when oil was discovered near Shiprock, New Mexico the Navajos wished to retain the revenue. To facilitate this, the federal government sponsored the election of

an all tribal council. This council signed oil leases in the name of the Navajo Tribe, thus establishing a right for the Navajo Tribe to have a voice in the granting of leases and the disposal of royalties. It was around 1923 that a tribal council was formed out of pressure to deal with the outside world with some measure of justice for the benefit of the Navajo people. This was the beginning of the Navajos' attempt to deal with the United States Government as a formal unified tribe with a common language, heritage and belief.

Purpose of the Study

The purpose of this study is twofold: First, the study will describe what the Navajos have done for themselves before the advent of the Anglo-Saxon people and other immigrants from other countries. It will also speak to how the United States government and the State Department of Public Welfare have tried to solve their welfare problems. Social Services other than financial assistance, were still yet not offered until January, 1967 to August, 1970, when the Navajo Demonstration project came in under Health, Education and Welfare (HEW), but was administered by the Arizona Department of Public Welfare. The study of Navajo welfare history shows that the Navajos were seldom consulted as to what they wanted for themselves, but programs were often designed by other people in the larger society.

Secondly, Navajo caseworkers and caseaides have been interviewed in an attempt to determine to what extent the present day social welfare services are meeting the Navajo needs. Finally, an effort has been made to pull together some recommendations as to possible directions of new program planning for the Navajo people. This study will treat the Navajo welfare program as a process operating within a cultural system (The Navajo Way of Life) which is an enclave in a larger cultural system (The United States of America).

Relevance of the Study

The above area needs attention since few studies have been undertaken to show what some of the problems were and what could be done to serve the Navajo people better. History will also show that it is difficult to help the Navajos in relationship to the past and present welfare problem. Jurisdictional problems between agencies are many, as a vast complex of agencies, local, state and Federal all have roles in dealing with Navajo welfare.

One of the reasons why many Navajos are in need of welfare assistance is the lack of jobs available on the Navajo reservation. Peter McDonald, the Navajo Tribal Chairman has said there was 65% unemployment on the Navajo reservation. This unemployment rate is exceptionally high as opposed to 5.1% nationwide unemployment rate. There are many other related problem of education, language, history and culture that need examination. Then too, professional welfare programs may need to precede or at least accompany community planning and industrial development. Thus, in view of the lack of industrial and other developments on the Navajo reservation, the Navajo people may in many ways, be chained to an existence of poverty by the lack of a developing social services program.

Welfare: It is Many Things

There are other problems that hinder giving aid to the Navajos on the reservation. Roads continue to be a problem. When it snows or rains, mud and snow make home visiting difficult due to the impassable roads. The majority of the Navajo people needing welfare assistance live in remote, isolated areas, therefore, making it virtually impossible to meet their needs. It is often difficult for caseworkers to make a lot of visitations due to the bad roads and long distances. It is feared that the constant pressure upon the staff to perform beyond reasonable work levels may effect the health and personal

lives of the staff. This may call for additional staff, especially those who are trained in the field of human development. Then, also, not all cases are followed up closely because there is no realistic hope of being able to offer help. It may be futile to develop additional services when present staff are being overworked. It may not be possible to maintain a competent level of service with present budgets. At the present time, there is no known way to make social work more efficient except through training and supervision, in that order. The social service program on the reservation may have to remain essentially static until additional staff and training is available, even if new programs that meet the needs of the Navajo people are developed. The continuing loss in terms of human development and human resources cannot be allowed to continue.

The Need for Training

There is no training center on the Navajo reservation for the poor or the uneducated Navajos. It is estimated that most of those on welfare are past middle age with approximately 80% of the men having received a third grade education or less. These persons obviously find it extremely difficult to compete with younger and more highly educated persons in the job market on and near the Navajo reservation. People in this age category are generally considered too old and illiterate for successful employment assistance. Then too, extended work experience programs may not be suited to this age group. There are, in addition, few educational facilities available for those who know little English or those who choose to continue their training for a job on the Navajo reservation.

Theoretical Orientation and Value Position

What is implied is that these problems are not being solved adequately by existing agencies and services. Present programs are not solving the Navajo

welfare problems because good programs (responsive to Navajo needs) do not exist. The Navajos need more than traditional welfare to solve some of their problems. Programs that are presently available seem to complicate the whole picture to the Navajos as they do not seem to look at a Navajo as a total person within his own environment. Existing programs do not take into account the particulars of the Navajo culture.

Little effort has been made to go to the Navajo people to get ideas from them about the Navajo welfare problem. It is of utmost importance to get ideas from the people being served in an attempt to solve their problems. It is the intent of this study to find out what possible solutions exist in the eyes of Navajo welfare workers. For this purpose Navajo caseworkers working on the Navajo reservation have been interviewed with respect to their ideas and concepts. Finally, the data has been analyzed toward suggesting possible solutions to the many welfare problems that exist.

Chapter II

An Overview of Navajo Welfare Projects: A Historical Perspective

The Early Navajo

Tree rings of Navajo hogan sites date back to as early as 1491 A.D. in the states of Arizona and New Mexico. The Navajos, during this time, were dependent upon hunting, seed gathering and raiding for a livelihood. The Navajos also at an early period, as a result of Pueblo and Spaniard contact, adopted agriculture as a basic way of life, and by 1630, they became enemies with the Spaniards. The Navajos began raiding the Spaniards and during this time obtained sheep and horses from them. In 1680-96; during which time, the Navajos learned to weave from the Pueblos. Between 1705-43 A.D., twelve witnesses in the Rabal document described the Navajos as raising corn, beans, squash, chile, cotton, pumpkins, watermelons, and having sheep and horses, and carrying on much trade with the Pueblos. The Navajos were also doing some basket and pottery work around this time (Hester, 1962):

> According to Young (1961) the expansion....following the acquisition of horses in the 17th century, and the advent of sheep and goats during the same period led to rapid changes in the economy and the way of life of the People. From seed-gathering, hunters and seasonal agriculturists, the Navajo changed with the introduction of livestock to depend primarily upon their herds for a living. This was supplemented by raiding and agriculture....(p. 144).

The Navajos eat the meat of livestock and make bedding and clothing from hide of the animal killed. Young (1961) had stated that around 1846, there emerged "a picture of the Navajos relatively small group of people bound loosely together by a common language and culture....(p. 144)".

For centuries before the coming of the Europeans, the Navajos had been accustomed to roaming over vast expanses of the Southwest. Only natural barriers such as rivers and mountains limited their wandering. Life was hard for them, but trade with neighboring groups enriched their valuable possessions

and culture. It was around this time that the American calavary came and then long columns of immigrant wagons. It was decided by the United States Government that the Navajos should no longer live between the Four Sacred Mountains.- the land of their forefathers. The Federal Government decided that they would remove the Navajos from their land and move them to a place called Fort Sumner where they would make farmers out of them. In 1863 a large detachment of soldiers, under the command of Colonel Kit Carson rounded up the Navajos and relocated them on the banks of the Pecos River known as the Bosque Redondo. Homes and fields were burned and livestocks and Navajos who resisted were killed in the process of this removal to Fort Sumner. Some of the Navajos who did not get caught by Kit Carson and his troops remained on their forefathers land. The Navajos that were removed to Fort Sumner remained there until 1868 when a treaty was drawn up between the United States Government and the Navajo Tribe.

Young (1961) has described that the basis of the relationship between the United States Government and the Navajo Tribe is established by the treaty of 1868 known as "Naaltoos Sane" (the old papers) in the English language. This treaty originally established "3.5 million acres" within the old Navajo country for a reservation after the people returned from Fort Sumner (p. 42).

Chief Barboncito and leaders like Manuelito, Delgado, Largo, Herrero, Armijo, Ganado Mucho and others were greatly responsible for arranging and leading the Navajos to return to their old land. According to Link (1968) Barboncito said to General William T. Sherman and Commissioner Samuel F. Tappan in a council meeting:

> The bringing us here has caused a great decrease of our members. Many of us have died, also a great number of our animals. Our grandfathers had no idea of living in any other country except our own and I do not think it right for us to do so....This ground we were brought on, it is not productive, we plant but it does not yield; all the stock we brought here have nearly all died. Because

> we were brought here, we have done all that we could possibly do, but found it to be labor in vain....There are a great many among us who have nothing in their houses to sleep on except gunny sacks....For that reason my mouth is dry, and my head hangs in sorrow to see those around were at one time well off so poor now....It seems that whatever we do here causes death (p. 1).

The primary reason why the Navajos were removed to Fort Sumner was due to the effort of General James Carleton, who had had all kinds of ideas about how he could make the Navajos self-sufficient through farming. The experiment did not succeed due to repeated crop failures and also the discouragement of Navajos attitudes. The Navajo believed that nothing would grow because they were not living within the jurisdictional boundaries of the four sacred mountains. The four sacred mountains are the Sierra Blanca, Mount Taylor, San Francisco and La Plata Mountain.

Barboncito, Manuelito and other headman convinced General Sherman and Commissioner Samuel Tappan that their old homeland was a good place for their people. A treaty was therefore drawn up between the U.S. Government and the Navajo Tribe on June 1, 1868 by 29 Navajo headman. This treaty was actually drawn up in May 1868, but was signed by the President of the United States, Mr. Andrew Johnson, on June 1, 1868.

The 1868 treaty composes of thirteen articles, of which Article VII, VIII, IX, and XII, are related to Navajo welfare in one way or another.

Welfare Provisions

According to Link (1968), Article VII promises the Navajos seed, tools and money to buy these items. Article VII reads:

> When the head of a family shall have selected lands and received his certificate as....directed, and the agent shall be satisfied that he intends in good faith to commence cultivating the soil for a living, he shall be entitled to receive seeds and agricultural implements for the first year, not exceeding in value one hundred dollars, and for each succeeding year he shall be entitled to receive seeds and implements to the value of twenty-five dollars (p. 7).

Article VIII in Link (1968) states:

> In lieu of all sums of money or other annuities provided to be paid to the Indians herein named under any or treatie heretofore made, the United States agrees to deliver at the agency house on the reservation herein named, on the first day of September of each year for ten years, the following articles, to wit.
>
> Such articles of clothing, goods or raw materials in heir thereof, as the agent may make his estimate for, not exceeding in value five dollar per Indian-each Indian being encouraged to manufacture their own clothing, blankets, &c: to be furnished with no article which they can manufacture themselves. And, in order that the Commissioner of Indian Affairs may be able to estimate properly for the articles herein named, it shall be the duty of the agent each year to forward to him a full and exact census of the Indians, on which the estimate from year to year can be based.
>
> Ard in addition to the articles herein named, the sum of ten dollars for each person entitled to the beneficial effects of this treaty shall be annually appropriated for a period of ten years, for each person who engaged in farming or mechanical pursuits, to be used by the Commissioner of Indian Affairs in the purchase of such articles as from time to time the condition and necessities of the Indians may indicate to be proper; and if within the ten years at any time it shall appear that the amount of money needed for clothing, under the article, can be appropriated to better use for the Indians named herein, the Commissioner of Indian Affairs may change the appropriation to other purposes, but in no event shall the amount of this appropriation to be withdrawn or discontinued for the period named, provided they remain at peace. And the President shall annually detail an officer of the army to be present and attest the delivery of all the goods herein named to the Indians, and he shall inspect and report on the quantity and quality of the goods and the manner of their delivery (p. 7).

Article IX pertains to hunting rights, which reads as such in Link (1968) the Indians shall:

> retain the right to hunt on any unoccupied lands continuous to their reservations, so long as the large game may range thereon in such numbers as to justify the chase;...(p. 7).

Article XII, according to Link (1968) states:

> It is further agreed by and between the parties to their agreement that the sum of one hundred and fifty thousand dollars appropriated or to be appropriated shall be disbursed as follows, subject to any conditions provided, in the law, to wit:
>
> 1st. The actual cost of the removal of the tribe from the Bosque Redondo reservation to the reservation, say fifty thousand dollars.
>
> 2nd. The purchase of fifteen thousand sheep and goats, at a cost not to exceed thirty thousand dollars.

3rd. The purchase of five hundred beef cattle and a million pounds of corn, to be collected and held at the military post nearest the reservation, subject to the orders of the agent, for the relief of the needy during the coming winter.

4th. The balance, if any, of the appropriation to be invested for the maintenance of the Indians pending their removal in such manner as the agent who is with them may determine.

5th. The removal of this tribe to be made under the supreme control and direction of the military commander of the Territory of New Mexico, and when completed, the management of the tribe to revert to the proper agent (p. 8).

Young (1968) states that following the signing of the treaty between the United States government and the Navajos, the Navajos left Fort Sumner to return to their respective old homeland. After June 15, 1868, some 7,000 Navajos left Fort Sumner, also known as Bosque Redondo (p. 15). Young (1968) further stated that in the meantime, Peace Commissioner, Samuel F. Tappan, asked for a volunteer to work out plans for the Navajos future. Special Agent John Ward of Santa Fe answered the Peace Commissioner on "August 14, 1868" stating that he had volunteered to make plans for the Navajos future and welfare. He stated that he had a lot of experience with the Indians and was sure he would do a good job in making plans for the Navajos. As it turned out, his plan for the Navajos, was similar to General James Carleton, with an emphasis by Ward on proposedly a political organization (p. 44). General Carleton was the man who fought the Navajos during the outbreak of the Civil War at Santa Fe and around that area because his troops were restless, doing primarily maintenance work, and with no one else to fight. General Carleton had his men fight the Indians to keep them occupied. This initially led to the Navajos Long Walk to Fort Sumner and back. General Carleton had hoped that they would become self-sufficient while they were at Fort Sumner, but as it turned out, they did not.

According to Young (1968) the first distribution of sheep and goats were

made in November 1860, where a total of 35,000 sheep and goats were issued to the Navajos (p. 45). The Navajos, who did not go to Fort Sumner knew that the rest of the people would someday be returning, so they saved many things, so they could share this with their people, when they returned. According to Julius Sombrero in Young (1968), a relative of one of the captured Navajo named Hoskinninni, urged his people, throughout the period of captivity, to take good care of their herds because one day the people would return and they would be in need (p. 45). In the year of 1869, after the return from Fort Sumner, most Navajos were gathered at what is now Fort Wingate, New Mexico, while the rest wandered to their old homeland in hopes of finding their old home or relatives. Young (1968) claimed that those that were gathered around Fort Wingate "subsisted on rations supplied by the Army....at times shipments of provisions arrived late, or the quantity was not enough to meet the need. Shipments somehow tended to "shrink" enroute-or the orders were not entirely filled (p. 45)." This shows that the treaty of 1868 was not fulfilled in terms of low quantity of rations. Although the Navajos were still planting corn and other agricultural products, nothing would grow much due to lack of rain.

Young (1968) has said:

> So precarious was the situation that, even as early as the fall of 1868, Agent Dodd advised the Indian Office that the rations were essential if the Indians were not to starve or resort to stealing ... (p. 45).

By 1870, Young (1968) said conditions had not improved and,

> Congress was late in making its then meager appropriations of funds for the Indian Bureau. The following year, 1871, was equally bad. A late frost, followed by a dry summer, again destroyed the crops and many Navajos began to steal livestocks from people living around the reservation. The agent made an urgent request for relief money and he advised the Indian Office that the tribe could never become self-supporting from agriculture in such a region (p. 46).

The 1872 census, as Link (1968) said, was 9,114, based on the number who

went to the agency for rations. They had 130,000 sheep and 10,000 horses (p. 7). The Navajos were still going to the post for all distribution, and this was pretty much the center of all activities. The distributions were all an effort to help the Navajos rebuild their economy. According to Young (1968), the Navajo agent, Thomas V. Kean, advised the Commissioner that "if the Tribe were held strictly within the Reservation boundaries it would soon be necessary for the Federal Government to maintain them by annual subsidy (p. 287)."

The Need for More Land

By 1876, conditions were still bad. Young (1968) said,

> this year there was a plague of grasshoppers that destroyed many crops. The pressure for more land, especially in the form of a southern extention of the reservation, gained momentum only to come to a sudden halt when it was discovered that the desired lands were among areas granted to the railroad (p. 47).

Young (1968) said Chief Manuelito and some other headmen went to Washington to see President Grant in hopes of getting additional land for their people. After negotiating, the U.S. Government offered the Navajos lands north of the San Juan River in exchange for those given to the railroads. The value of this land was not as good as the ones lost to the railroad, but it was an additional to the reservation (p. 48).

Young (1968) has shown that it was around this time that trading posts were first established on the Navajo reservations. It was estimated that in 1877, Navajo blankets, hides and some 200,000 pounds of wool were being taken to distant markets via trading posts. As a result of traders and the expansion of the railroads, south and east of the Navajo reservation, liquor began to be popular (p. 48-49).

Related Welfare Problems

Young (1968) also speaks of General S. C. Armstrong's letter, which was written to the BOSTON Daily Advertisers on September 13, 1883, which reflects

some of the Navajo problems. General Armstrong "reported that Navajo population had increased to 17,000 and that the tribe had possession of the rangelands for 50 miles in all directions beyond their reservation boundaries (p. 50-51)." Young (1968) added that Navajo livestock had also increased to 1,000,000 sheep and goats and 15,000 horses. Secretary of Interior, Teller, appointed D. M. Riordan to be the Indian Agent and to straighten out the "Navajo problem" as mentioned by General Armstrong. Agent Riordan left the reservation in disgust when he found out the U.S. Government failed,

> to do what the treaty of 1868 promised; viz, to provide a teacher and school house for every 30 children, seeds and implements at the rate of $150.00 to each head of family, clothing to a value of $5 per Indian, farming tools at the rate of $10 a piece (p. 50).

Young (1968) has found that "the Navajo appropriation in 1882 was only $5,000 with an unexpended balance of $156,651 from the treaty appropriation (p. 51)."

In 1884, former Agent Dennis V. Riordan had returned to Navajo country and assisted the Navajo people in obtaining 2,468,125 acres of land. In Agent Riordan's letter to Commissioner Price, according to Young (1968) he said:

> I don't know if 500 whites with all the appliances of civilization could live on the same ground (the reservation) without subsistance. How in the world are you going to compel 17,000 Indians to do it (p. 287).

During this time, a Navajo Indian by the name of Old Mexican, in an autobiography, tells of his experience as it related to himself when he was around nine years old. Old Mexican said:

> I use to milk my goat and drink the milk right away. We had plenty to eat, we raised corn ourselves, but we had little clothing and went naked most of the time...I was big enough now to handle a hoe and chop a little wood. I used to haul water also, and herd sheep....A year after the sheep were issued they gave us some cloth, but by the time I was eleven I was becoming ragged again. I was getting to be a good sheep herder, and could chop wood. That winter we had no snow, and in the spring there was no feed, so we went to Navajo Mountain, and there we put in a crop....When I was

> fifteen I built hogans by myself. Every morning I went to chop trees and trimmed them. I thought this chopping would make me a strong man, that is the reason I did it. All I thought about was having lots of sheep, that was why I was always doing something. I was big enough now to pack my own wool to the store and buy what I wanted. I no longer needed to send someone else. There were getting to be many trading posts around. Before this there had been only Fort Defiance and Tuba City....where they bought hides, even dog hides, and wool. About this time the people started to gamble with cards and to drink. I watched them, but I never tried to join them (p. 17-19).

With this autobiography of Old Mexican in mind, one can imagine why Navajos had many sheep and had survived the many obstacles and hardships they faced during those days.

By 1893, things really had not improved that much, so out of concern according to Young (1961), Agent Edwin H. Plummer wrote to the Commissioner and said:

> the idea that the Navajos are self-supporting is certainly erroneous-unless subsisting on cattle of white people can be called self-support. Their principle diet is meat, and they never use their ponies or sheep for food if they can get beef by stealing. They are poor and getting poorer, and unless assisted materially very soon they must be fed by the Government or forced to increase their stealing (p. 288).

The reservation was getting overcrowded with livestock and as a result the soil was eroding and the animal reproduction was also poor.

Young (1961) also found that in 1914, Fr. Anslem Weber of St. Michaels, Arizona published a brochure entitled "The Navajo Indians-A Statement of Facts," in which he recounted Navajo land problems in detail, and in which he quoted Assistant Commissioner of Indian Affairs Meritt to the effect that "while they (the Navajo) have great potential resources, they are really suffering much of the time for want of sufficient subsistence and clothing (p. 288)."

According to Link (1968) the Navajo Tribal Census Office showed some Navajos owned automobiles; Chee Dodge owned a Dodge, and Tom Damon, Willie Damon, Hosteen Yazza and Clitsoi Dedman all owned Fords (p. 25). In 1921, the

first oil was discovered on the Navajo reservation near Shiprock, New Mexico, and of course, the Navajos wished to retain the revenue. The Navajo Tribe organized and later formed a council to sign oil leases and this granted them the right to lease and dispose of royalties. As soon as the states and federal government discovered the Navajos as having some type of money they began making all sorts of plans for it themselves, again. This kind of problem within the administration led to the popular study known as the Meriam Report.

The Meriam Report

Two important incidents in the treatment of Indians lead to this report. One incident is called the Lee's Ferry Bridge and the other is Jackson Barnett case. According to Kelly (1968) the Lee's Ferry controversy consisted of the Indian reimbursable debts (38 stat., 582). This came about in 1914:

> Congress authorized the construction of Indian irrigation projects from federal funds with the understanding that such projects should be reimbursed from tribal funds (38 stat., 582)....In time the concept of reimbursable appropriations was stretched to cover projects other than irrigation and to include those tribes which had no tribal funds, on the pretext that someday they might come into an income (p. 82-83).

Kelly (1968) said the Indian reimbursable debts is the customary measure for justification and approval for this was to get a statement from the Department of Interior that a bridge or highway would benefit a certain Indian tribe. Indians would automatically be charged with half the expense and they would in turn repay when they had the money. There was no problem until in 1920 when Congress decided to collect some debts, by law. It was not until February 26, 1925 that this law began to give obvious problems to the governments due to the Lee's Ferry bridge. On the above stated date, the Indian Appropriation Bill for fiscal year 1926 was signed into law (45 stat., 694, p. 83).

> Kelly (1968) said one item, accepted at the time without opposition, was an authorization of $100,000, reimbursable from any funds now

> or hereafter placed in the treasury of the Navajo Reservation Indians for the construction of a bridge across the Colorado River six miles below Lee's Ferry, Arizona (p. 84).

Arizona legislature also had to approve their half before such a project would begin. As this case came out, the Lee's Ferry bridge became a symbol of controversy in Federal Indian Policy. Those opposing the bridge argued that the bridge was going to be at a place where there were few people and it just happened to be located at a place where the state of Arizona had a proposed highway planned. The Navajo Agent during this period was Hagerman, who did not know about the reimbursable policy, so he had originally instructed the Navajos to go ahead and spend their money the way they saw fit. When he found out about the policy, he contacted Commissioner Burke for instruction. Burke did not respond until the spring of 1925. Burke outlined how the Navajos were to spend their oil royalties:

1. to develop the water supply in those locations where such action would make available large areas of grazing land now incapable of being used because of a lack of water;
2. to breed up Navajo sheep through the purchase of good breeding stock; and
3. to purchase agricultural implements....it will only be good business to expend a portion of the oil money for improving roads and bridges (p. 85).

When the Navajo Tribe heard of this, they strongly objected to this proposal. They now had ideas and plans of their own. Jacob C. Morgan, Navajo Tribal Chairman, of Shiprock contacted Washington requesting that they consult the council before they make other plans in relation to the Navajo people.

Kelly (1968) further talked about a fight that broke cut in Congress when it actually came down to appropriating the money for the bridge in 1926. Senator Ashurst (Az) and Senator Carl Hayden (Az) wanted the bridge and Senator Ralph Cameron (Rep., Az), Senator Sam G. Bratton (Dem., New Mex.) Repre. Frear and John Collier did not want the bridge. Commissioner Burke definitely wanted the bridge, but Navajo Agent Hagerman did not think it was necessary, but shared

this thought only with Superintendent Kneale of Shiprock and Senator George H. Williams (Rep., Missouri), who discussed a letter he had written on the floor of the Senate. When Hagerman's view became public, Commissioner Burke got angry with him and sent him a letter of reprimand. The Lee's Ferry Bill passed the Senate and went to the President for his signature on March 3, 1926. Congressman Frear, John Collier and others criticized the Indian Bureau under the direction of Commissioner Burke, and Assistant Meritt for supporting and approving a bill that:

> looted the treasury of the Navajo Indians....and that the only justification of this looting is found in a plea that a reimbursable charge eventually to be paid by the Indians will not be paid immediately (p. 83-88).

In the Jackson Barnett case Kelly (1968) said Jackson happened to have become a Creek Indian millionaire when he discovered oil on his Oklahoma allotment. Jackson had requested Commissioner Burke in 1922 to place $1,100,000 in two equal trust accounts. The negotiation led to an agreement where Barnett should receive only the interest from the trust during his lifetime and when he is deceased, one account would go to his wife and the other to the American Baptist Home Mission Society of New York. This was not questioned until 1925, when Barnett's guardian filed a suit to have the trust declared invalid because it did not go through the Oklahoma County Court in which Barnett resided. The Barnett case became a case of whether the courts had more authority than the Bureau of Indian Affairs. Barnett was subpoenaed to court after several countercharges. Barnett was living in California at the time, but was taken back to Oklahoma and later to New York for a trial, where he was declared mentally incompetent. The Justice Department filed fraud and corruption against Burke and the Secretary of the Interior (p. 137). The Lee's Ferry and Barnett incidents led to Burke's resignation in 1939. These two primary incidents led to the study of the Indian Administration problem by Lewis M. Meriam.

Young (1961) claims that "the report of this study stressed the need for trained social workers in the Indian Service, and recommended the addition of social case worker positions (p. 289)." The Commissioner that was appointed after Burke, Charles J. Rhoads, in 1929, tried hard to implement the Meriam Report, according to Kelly (1968). In 1931, he made Robert T. Landsdale (social worker) his assistant. Mr. Landsdale's job was to coordinate all Human Relations activities. The first social work positions were established in the Bureau (Branch of Education) at this time, but not on the Navajo reservation. The first Branch of Welfare was established on June 12, 1941 and the first social worker position under this branch was not confirmed until in 1943. Mrs. Bessie Trowbridge Daly and Mrs. Ruby Tomlinson McDermott, both MSW's, were put in these two positions. Both women were former teachers prior to their graduate work in social work (p. 289).

The Decade of the 1930's

The decade of the 1930's must not be forgotten as this was the time of the great depression in the whole United States of America, but for the Navajos, there was also the additional problem of stock reduction, which made the Indian problem very acute as Young (1961) has said. There was definitely a need for welfare assistance to the Navajos during the depression, but the event of the public works project, i.e. WPA, PWA, and other similar work lessened the need for direct relief (p. 289).

One of the leading incidents which led to the stock reduction according to Young (1968) was due to a report submitted by a Bureau forester, William Zeh, on December 23, 1930 in regards to the Navajo range. Zeh claimed that the Navajos owned 1,297,589 sheep and goats, 80,000 horses and 27,000 cattle. Zeh also stated that the reservation was becoming over stocked and soil was eroding very rapidly. He also noted that there was no market for the stock

in the face of the national depression. As a result, the Department of the Interior adopted a federal policy in an attempt to conserve the natural resources (p. 67).

Livestock has always been a symbol of wealth to the Navajos and to plan for stock reduction in the midst of the national depression caused high anxiety among the Navajos. Young (1968) reports:

> In the fall of 1932, Superintendent Hunter made an urgent request for....three car loads of flour from the Red Cross. In his letter to the Commissioner, Superintendent Hunter said "Depression for the last three years through the country has perhaps hit the Navajo people more severely than it has the average white person....The Navajo is almost entirely dependent upon his income from the live-stock industry-principally the sale of wool and lambs....there has been practically no market for lambs and wool. During the past winter the Indian was forced to feed his corn, which is ordinarily sold to the trader, to his sheep. This again reduced his income (p. 68).

John Collier, who had been lobbying for Indians for eleven years, was now the Commissioner of Indian Affairs. His philosophy is described by Kelly (1968) as advocating for Indians betterment and he also had strong intentions to implement the Meriam Report, like Commissioner Rhoads. Collier, in order to save Navajo range, proposed a reduction of 400,000 animals. Collier told the Navajos that the loss of income as a result of the stock reduction would somehow be made up by jobs that would be provided under the soil-erosion and conservation program. When this program ended in four or five years, the range would then be restored and they could increase their stock again. The Navajos were very much resistent to this idea, but Collier went ahead and made arrange-ments with Harry Hopkins, Federal Surplus Relief Administration to purchase 100,000 sheep and goats (p. 159). The stock reduction has often been described as statistically a success, but psychologically a failure to the Navajos. An example of this is given by Buck Austin, who spent 82 days in jail due to his resistance to the stock-reduction. Buck's story is carried in the Navajo

Historical Selections, by Young and Morgan (1954). Buck says:

> It is true that, at the trading post they keep blankets for sale, but who can afford to buy them? We are poverty stricken. That is how our children get sick. They are sick because they are cold and hungry. They do not eat much, and as a result, they become chronic cases. I increased the herd that were given to me. I kept building up my herd until I had 550 head. I ended up with 65 head of cattle, and 48 horses. I was allowed to keep 6 horses, but even so I complained. I was told to get rid of the sheep, but I had many children, with no mother. I was their only mother, and they were dependent upon my livestock. My neighbors too depended upon my herds, for I always took care of their needs when they had ceremonies.
>
> After all this stock reduction took place, I was told to take out a permit under the Special Regulations for the remainder of my stock, but I didn't want to do so. I felt that the permitted number was too few for a living. I didn't want to, and I fought back, thinking that I might somehow emerge the victor. But this soon led to my arrest, and landed me in jail at Tuba City. The night I was put in jail many other people were jailed too. I found then that they had all had sheep trouble. From there they took me to Fort Defiance, where they put me in jail. I stayed there two days. They tried to get me to eat, but I refused to do so. Then they took me off again, to the Holbrook jail, where I spent two more days. And then the white policeman again came for me, and I was imprisoned at Prescott....I spent 82 days in jail, going from one jail to another. Finally a lawyer came, and I was freed, whereupon I returned home. There I found that half of my remaining livestock had been taken away. Of my sheep, 155 had been taken, and I had only 6 horses. That was what I found upon my return. I thought it over and decided to carry on the best I could (p. 63).

Dan Phillips, according to Young and Morgan (1954) also expresses himself

Mr. Phillips says:

> A great number of the people's livestock was taken away. Although we were told that it was to restore land, the fact remains that hunger and poverty stood with their mouths open to destroy us.... First they have to send money across the sea to Europe to take care of things there. On the other hand, we're right here before their eyes, but some of you who are our national leaders must first appropriate money for the Germans and the Japanese because those people are said to be starving. Those people made war upon you and wanted to kill you, but you say that they must come first- that they must eat first. We were here on our own land a long time before you white people came, increasing rapidly, but you came and reduced us to poverty. You have reduced us to poverty, but you pass us over, saying that the Germans must eat. So, my leaders who live in Washington, give us back something that is worthwhile. I do not speak thus out of hate for you. It is my plea, I say it because all of my neighbors feel likewise (p. 71).

As one can see, the stock reduction proposal was entirely foreign to the Navajos, because raising livestock had been a way of life for the Navajos for over 300 years.

Relationship with State Welfare Programs

Between 1933 and 1934, 90,000 sheep were sold. This was perhaps the beginning of the shift from the livestock economy to the wage work economy emphasis for the Navajos.

Robert Young (1961) has found that,

> although the Social Security Act was passed in 1935, and the states of Arizona, New Mexico and Utah established Public Welfares in 1936....neither Arizona nor New Mexico included assistance to Indians under their state programs. Efforts to have needy Navajos included in these programs were continued throughout the 1940's (p. 290).

Roger C. Wolf, (1968) in an article entitled "Needed: A System of Income Maintenance for Indians" claims that not enough was accomplished in attempting to get Indians on welfare partially because of "the Indians" lack of political power to demand the necessary changes. Another reason given by Wolf as to why Indians have been excluded from state welfare is through discriminatory practices of doubtful constitutional validity (p. 597).

Wolf (1968) further states that:

> beginning with an unpublished memorandum opinion by the Solicitor of the Department of the Interior in 1936, there have been several rulings to the effect that reservation Indians are eligible for state categorical assistance. Despite these rulings, states continue to discriminate against Indians. Discrimination which has been met judicially. In state ex. rel. Williams v. Kemp, the Supreme Court of Montana held that the citizenship provision of the Social Security Act prohibited Montana from requiring reimbursement from counties containing reservations for assistance provided the Indians by the state....The Supreme Court....held that race alone cannot be made the basis of state discrimination, and it seems clear that states which deny categorical assistance to reservation Indians do so only on the basis of race....it was not until after the Second World War that the BIA and Federal Security Agency (the predecessor of HEW) began pressuring Arizona to provide assistance for reservation Indians (p. 602).

According to Young (1961), the "Navajos were encouraged and assisted to

make applications at their county department of public welfare, but to no avail (p. 290)." Different agencies got themselves involved in trying to get the Navajos accepted for welfare payments, and as a result, applications were finally accepted, but no payments were made. It was not until July 30, 1943 that a Bureau-wide cash assistance programs as instituted in lieu of rations, regardless of the Snyder Act of November 2, 1921 (25 U.S.C. 13) which states in the Bureau of Indian Affairs Manuel,

> that the Bureau shall direct, supervise, and expend such moneys as Congress may from time to time appropriate for the benefit, care, and assistance of Indians throughout the United States. The annual appropriation for the Department of Interior includes funds for welfare services to Indian children and adults in need of assistance...(p. 66IAM 3.1).

Regardless of this statement in the Bureau of Indian Affairs manuel, Young (1961) said:

> It was not until 1945 that general assistance in the form of checks was extended to Navajos, in lieu of rations, and not until 1948 that the administration of the general assistance program was placed in the Navajo Agency Branch of Welfare....case load average for the seven year period, 1941-47, was 552 families, totaling 2,165 persons. Monthly grants during this period were extremely low, ranging from $4.48-5.35 per family ($1.05-5.99 per person), and such aid was available only to emergency cases including the helpless blind, the aged, the crippled, and destitute widows with dependent children (p. 290-291).

The Aftermath of World War II

By the end of World War II, many Navajos who had been to war and those employed by wartime industries were out of jobs because they could not compete in the outside world due to their limited formal education. As a result of the destruction of their primary resources (in reference to the stock reduction), the Navajos were in a desperate situation and definitely needed outside help, financially speaking. Their plight became so critical that it soon drew national attention to their problems.

In October, 1947, according to Young (1961), three Congressional Committees, visited the Navajo Reservation. Assistant Secretary of

> the Interior, William E. Warne joined one of the groups at the reservation and presented in very condensed form, the Departments long-range proposal for Navajo rehabilitation ...(p. 291).

During this time, there were 450 families out of approximately 4,125 Navajo families on general assistance. Those on general assistance annual income were estimated around $750.00 annually. It has further been pointed out by Young (1961) that around this period an agency report showed that "10,000 persons were probably eligible for public assistance, including 1,800 aged people, 8,000 dependent children and 300 blind persons (p. 292)." Continued national attention upon Navajo problems led the President to call a special session where it authorized $2,000,000 (but did not appropriate) for emergency relief under Public Law 390, as Young (1961) found. This law also authorized the Secretary of the Interior to draw up a plan for the Navajos to the legislature. The Navajo-Hopi long-range plan derived from this. It was not until December 23, 1947 that $500,000 of this money, under Public Law 390, was appropriated for relief and also for off-reservation employment (p. 292). Young (1961) has shown that the American Red Cross spend $73,441 and the Navajo Tribe $28,460.50 in addition to the Public Laws 390 appropriation for emergency relief. Private donators also donated 271 tons of food and 202.5 tons of clothing between December 1947 and January 1948. Additional staff (one supervisor and three social workers) were hired on the Navajo reservation this year to distribute the food and clothing. These additional staff were only hired for two and one-half months on this reservation. The first case records were developed in order to better regulate the welfare program. The Navajos still were no where near getting out of the pit of poverty, so they began asking for Congress for help on a formal basis (p. 293).

The Fernandez Amendment

According to Morgan and Young, Charles Collier prepared a ten-year program

for the Navajos and Hopis, now known as the Long-Range Program. In it's final form a section called the Fernandez Amendment was added to the original Long-Range Act. This amendment provided,

> for an extension of state, civil and criminal laws and court jurisdiction to the Navajo and Hopi Reservation. On October 13, 1949, the Navajo Tribal Council adopted a resolution urging President Truman to veto the bill because the Navajos did not approve of Section 9. President Truman....vetoed the bill on October 17, 1949 and sent it back to Congress....Congress adjourned on October 19, 1949, but early in the following year the Long-Range Bill was reconsidered ard passed. It was signed into law by President Truman on April 19, 1950, and the initial appropriation in the sum of $8,645,520 became available in October, 1950 (p. 161).

Young and Morgan (1954) said the primary reason why the Navajo Tribe did not want Section 9 of the Long-Range Program is because they felt that this might endanger their land and water rights. John Collier and Oliver La Farge supported the Navajo Tribal Council on its decision in regards to Section 9 of the Long-Range Bill. This amendment "would allow the state courts, as well as the Federal and Tribal Courts, to have jurisdiction over Navajo Affairs (p. 166)."

Tom Lincoln, according to Young and Morgan (1954) speaks of the Fernandez Amendment:

> I am not the only one who is sick on account of it. When I go to the homes of my people everywhere; when I see poverty and the uneducated children, and think about their hardships, then it really sickens me. That's why I don't like this amendment.
>
> They say that they want to rush us into doing the things that the white people do on the outside-paying taxes and the like. Comparing the Navajos with the whites; it is obvious that the Navajos cannot do all these things, they are not capable of them. This is what makes me sick. That is the way it appears to me, and I'm not in accord with the Fernandez Amendment (p. 172).

The Long-Range Act

Without the Fernandez Amendment, according to Young and Morgan (1954) the Long-Range Bill provided for the following things to be done:

1. Work will be carried on to save soil and water, and to make the range better.

2. The 78 irrigation projects already in existence on the reservation will be completed or made larger.
3. Timber, coal, minerals, and other resources on the Navajo and Hopi Reservations will be studied to find out how much of such things the Tribes own and to work out plans for using them.
4. Money will be provided to develop industries and businesses.
5. Money will be provided to help more Navajos and Hopis find jobs off the reservation, and to help people get started who have moved away from the reservation to live.
6. Money will be provided to put more land under irrigation at Parker, and to help Navajos and Hopis who want to go there to become farmers.
7. Money will be provided to build roads on the reservation.
8. Money will be provided to put in telephone and radio communications on the reservation.
9. Money will be provided to develop more water.
10. Money will be provided for loan fund with which to help Navajos and Hopis get back on their feet, or start up farms or businesses.
11. Money will be provided to build new hospitals and sanitariums and to improve those already in existence.
12. Money will be provided to make schools on the reservation larger. It will make some of the present day schools into boarding schools.
13. Navajos and Hopis will be given the first chance at jobs that become available on all projects authorized by this law, and outsiders will be hired for jobs only when there is no Navajo or Hopi who knows how to do the work involved.
14. The Navajo and Hopi Tribes can lease any of their lands, if they want to for such things as trading posts, missions, schools, and other purposes. The lease can be good as long as 25 years. At the end of 25 years they can renew the lease for another 25 years if they want to. The tribes can lease lands in this way with the approval of the Secretary of the Interior.
15. This bill authorized the Navajo and Hopi Tribes to draw up tribal constitutions, and tells how to go about it. These constitutions will give the Navajos and Hopis more voice in their own affairs.
16. The Navajos can spend tribal funds without having to go through Congress. All the Council will have to do from now on to spend tribal funds will be to decide what they want to spend the money for and then get the approval of the Secretary of the Interior.
17. This bill provides that the Navajo and Hopi Tribal Councils are to take part in making the plans for carrying out the different projects authorized by this law.
18. The Navajos and Hopis are put under social security for certain kinds of relief payments. People over 65 years of age who are not able to work and have nothing with which to support themselves will be given relief payments by the State in which they live, just like all other people who get relief under social security in the State. The State will also help children who have no means of support, and blind people who need help. These are the kinds of relief payments that will be made under social security. They will begin after July 1, 1950. The States have said that they could not afford to give social security to Indians, so the Federal Government is giving extra money to the

States to help them make payments to the needs of the aged, the needy blind and the dependent children among the Navajos and Hopis.

19. A committee of Congressman will see to it that all the provisions of this law are carried out the way they should be (p. 178-179).

Young (1961) found that this bill was not signed until April 19, 1950 by President Truman. In the meantime, while the bill was waiting for approval, the Navajos were suffering. On May 10, 1948 Congress appropriated $1,000,000 under Public Law 390, for emergency purposes for the Navajos and Hopis, while the Long-Range Act was awaiting its approval. This project was approved for road construction, soil conservation, irrigation work, and school and hospital repair work. The Bureau of Indian Affairs estimated to have found jobs for 13,000 Navajos off reservation during the summer and fall of 1948. These people who got jobs off reservation found jobs in mining, agriculture, railroad and similar types of work (p. 293-294).

The State's Involvement in Navajo Welfare

In 1949, according to Wolf (1968), Senators Andersen of New Mexico and Hayden of Arizona initiated a proposal to permit states to deny categorical assistance to Indians who had received BIA relief during the four years prior to their application for state assistance. The bill did not pass, and the controversy was temporarily settled by two measures-the Santa Fe Agreement of 1949 and a special federal funding arrangement for the Navajo and Hopi Reservation, the Navajo-Hopi Rehabilitation Act of 1950. The latter act contained a rider which required the Secretary of the Treasury to reimburse the states involved for 80 per cent of their contribution to the categorical assistance budget for Navajos and Hopis. This additional contribution, along with normal federal matching funds, resulted in the federal government contributing some 92% of the total funds (p. 68).

According to Wolf (1968), in the 1950's, Congress added Aid to the Permanently and Totally Disabled to the categories of available public assistance, and Arizona followed in 1952, but specifically excluded reservation Indians. The FSA disapproved Arizona's plans since the restriction imposed a residence requirement which was invalid under the Social Security Act. The district court ruled in favor of the Administration and Arizona appealed. The Courts of Appeal for the District of Columbia Circuit in Arizona v. Hobby, affirmed holding that since the United States had not consented to be sued, the action could not be maintained. Thus Arizona was forced to provide categorical assistance to Indians or to be denied federal matching funds to which it otherwise would be entitled (p. 603-604).

Recent Navajo Tribal Welfare Activity

According to Young (1961), the Navajo Tribe has looked to the Bureau of Indian Affairs for all things until the Long-Range Bill was passed in 1950:

> providing, in Section 7, that notwithstanding any other provision of existing law, the tribal funds now on deposit hereafter placed to the credit of the Navajo Tribe of Indians in the United States Treasury shall be available for such purposes as may be designated by the Navajo Tribal Council and approved by the Secretary of the Interior (p. 332).

This authority has allowed the tribe to practice more freedom to develop and maintain their programs and it also allowed them to get federal and state money for funding as well.

According to Young (1961), "it was not until February, 1957, that a Department of Community Services was created to administer...welfare, health, education and community development, and to provide a medium for liaison with parallel state and federal agencies (p. 334)." The function of the Navajo tribal welfare program as Young (1961) said is to give:

> temporary cash assistance, assistance in cases of destruction of the home by fire or disaster, burial and emergency transportation assistance, health rehabilitation assistance and a surplus commodity

> program for Arizona residence. The Tribal Welfare workers also serve as family counselors and as interpreters for the Social Security representatives (p. 340).

The Welfare Committee is responsible for planning programs and making policies in relation to the Navajo Tribal Welfare.

According to Shepardson (1963), the author claims:

> In 1958, 44 per cent of all wage work came from within the Navajo Area, including the reservation, the checkerboard allotted area, the Gallup Area Office, and the Bordertown Dormitories (Government dormitories for Navajos in State Schools). Off reservation jobs contributed 56% of all wage work (p. 24).

Shepardson (1963) also compares average per capita income of Navajos with other areas. In relation to this, she states that "for 1940 it was $497 in Arizona; $356 in New Mexico; and $81.89 for Navajos. In 1956, it was $1,718 for Arizona: $1,533 for New Mexico; and $1,940 for the nation; in 1958, it was $467 for Navajos (p. 25)."

Not much improvements had been made by the state of Arizona, other than that the Navajos were now applying for categorical assistance and would be approved for assistance, if they are qualified. Wolf (1968) speaks to the problem of caseworkers in relation to seeing a client. Wolf says:

> The inadequate number of state welfare workers is an acute problem on the vast Navajo Reservation. If a caseworker wants to see a recipient, he will write him a letter, in care of the nearest trading post, requesting a meeting at the trading post on a certain date. Frequently the letter will not reach its destination by that date or transportation will not be available to the recipient, and as a result, he may have his grant terminated for failure to cooperate with the social worker. Also, at the Navajo Reservation and elsewhere, applications for assistance must be made at the welfare offices or the trading posts because the caseworker simply does not have the time to take applications at the applicants' homes, and the Indians' chronic transportation problem mean that not all who need welfare will be able to apply for it (p. 613).

The Navajo Demonstration Project

The brighter side of state welfare assistance to Indians is represented by the Navajo Demonstration Project. Funded by HEW and administered by the Arizona State Department of Public Welfare, this program demonstrated how the

status of Indian welfare recipients can be improved through intensive social work by Indian caseworkers.

The Navajo Demonstration Project was a plan to demonstrate the value of establishing branch offices nearby heavy concentration of needy Indian families; to increase the recruitment of Navajo Indians into social work, and specifically into public welfare; to provide special funding for temporary salary increments so that public welfare will not be handicapped in recruiting and keeping Indian social workers and so that the states will have sufficient time to improve its public welfare compensation plan; to test the relative value of using interpreters or native workers in public welfare; to demonstrate the value of providing community services specialists to increase and improve the relationship between public welfare, the Navajo Tribal Council, offices of the U.S. Public Health Service, and the Bureau of Indian Affairs currently serving the Navajos; to demonstrate the value of a well-planned, appropriate in-service training program; and to reduce caseloads to a level where the provision of services becomes a reasonable expectation (Health, Education & Welfare, 1966).

The project was carried out in two counties, namely Apache and Navajo counties. These two counties supposedly had the highest number of Navajo population on welfare. Both counties were to establish a branch office on the reservation. Caseworkers, community specialist, welfare office assistance and case aides were to be at these branch offices. In one county, there were all Indian caseworkers and in another, Anglo caseworkers with Navajo interpreters. The purpose of this was to find out how effective these two methods were in the problem-solving process.

Four scholarships were also to be given annually to those chosen to have the qualifications to continue or begin in the social work schools. HEW also hoped to have the caseworkers carry a small caseload where it was reasonable to

do intensive casework (Health, Education & Welfare, 1966).

The Navajo Demonstration Project was in the end carried out in Apache, Navajo and Coconino counties from January 3, 1967 to August, 1970. All three counties had Navajo caseworkers and therefore did not test out how effective the Anglo caseworkers with Navajo interpreters were in the problem-solving process.

Summary

This chapter has dealt with the evolution of the Navajo people and of their problems of poverty and organization up to the current times.[1] The review of the literature starts with a description of early Navajo life and environment. It goes on to describe the mass exodus of the Navajo people under force by the U.S. Army troops led by Kit Carson. It continues with their return to their homeland, the treaties organizing them onto a reservation and the dire poverty that faced them then - and continues to face them today. The times of the Great Depression and World War II and their effects on the poverty cycles of the Navajo are discussed of programs that were introduced to deal with the poverty issues - some aided, others hurt the Navajos. They included: The Meriam Report, the reduction of livestock proposal, the Fernandez Amendment, the lack of state welfare benefits and the eventual provision for them, and finally the Navajo Demonstration Project.

---

[1] See appendix B for 1972 Fiscal Year expenditure on General Assistance, Clothing, Foster Care, Handicapped and other Services cases per month.

Chapter III

METHOD OF STUDY

This study is an exploratory effort designed to assess how Navajo caseworkers in 13 traditional agencies see the problems faced by the clientele their agencies service. It is a study of Navajo caseworkers perceptions of the needs and problems of the Navajo people.

The Population

The population of this study consists of a total of 112 Navajo caseworkers from 32 traditional agencies in the cities of Tuba City, Arizona and Window Rock, Arizona. The break down of Navajo caseworkers by agencies in each of the two cities are as follows: Tuba City: 56 Navajo caseworkers from 18 traditional agencies; Window Rock: 56 Navajo caseworkers from 14 traditional agencies.

Sample Collection

From the above total population, a sample of ten Navajo caseworkers from Tuba City and ten Navajo caseworkers from Window Rock (total of 20 in the sample) were selected through a process of random selection. This was done to control for possible bias on the part of the researcher as she is personally acquainted with most of the Navajo caseworkers in the study population. Of the total 32 traditional agencies in the population of the study, 13 were represented in the actual sample. The sample was selected at random by the project faculty chairman.

The two cities of Tuba City and Window Rock were selected as it was felt that the two cities are examples of the two very different life styles.

Tuba City is predominantly an agrarian community with emphasis on a livestock economy. The life-style of the people of this area is under little influence from modern, urbanization centers and the people of this area have therefore retained more of their traditional culture, practices and beliefs.

The main social problems of these people center around, unemployment, alcoholism, lack of services and dire poverty. This city resides within the Navajo-Hopi land-dispute area, also known as the Executive Order of 1882. The entire question of land use, ownership and development is extremely tenuous legally. This dispute has therefore prevented any real effort to industrialize and improve the area in question.

The city of Window Rock, Arizona is only 24 miles from Gallup, New Mexico, a large urban city known as the Indian Capital of the Southwest. Window Rock has a larger population condensed into a much smaller geographical area than does Tuba City. Window Rock is a wage economy with an industrial rather than agrarian economy prevailing.

Urbanization of the Navajo people of this area has led to many severe social problems such as juvenile delinquency, child neglect and abandonment, alcoholism, drug abuse and crime, and higher rates of unemployment and more welfare recipients than in Tuba City. The people of Window Rock appear to be more dependent upon government aid than those residing in Tuba City, as their traditional means of self-support and pride are less utilized in this area. One can see the identity crisis present among the Navajo people there, as traditional cultural beliefs and practices lose their value in the face of adopting the white man's way of life.

Data Collection Procedure

An open-ended interview guide was used in collecting data from the 20 respondents in the sample. This interview guide was designed to explore the following three major areas:

1. What are the unmet needs of the Navajo clientele as interpreted by their Navajo caseworkers.
2. How effective is the present service delivery system of the 13 traditional agencies as seen by the Navajo caseworkers.
3. What are the workers perceptions on questions of funding, administration, control and program development.

There were a total of 19 questions combined within these three major areas. The questions were constructed by the researcher based primarily upon her own personal experience as a caseworker with the Bureau of Indian Affairs and her first-hand observation of the needs of her people, the Navajos. The interviews were conducted in an office setting at the respective agencies. A minimum amount of interpretation of the sample questions was assured by the pretesting of the interview guide with three Navajo caseworkers that were among the original total population but not among those selected for the actual sample.

Biographical Data

The following section gives a biographical sketch of the 20 respondents in the study as to the following variables: Sex, Age, Education, Agency of Employment, Length of time worked for that agency and whether or not the respondents were Navajo speaking.

Table I

Sex of Respondent by Agency

	Agency		
	Tuba City	Window Rock	
Sex			Total
Male	8	7	15
Female	2	3	5

Of the 20 respondents totaled from TC and WR area combined, there were 15 males and 5 females. These 20 respondents were selected randomly out of 112 Navajo workers.

Table 2

Age Level of Respondents by Agency

Age	Agency: Tuba City	Agency: Window Rock	Total
20-25	2	3	5
26-30	2	2	4
31-35	1	1	2
36-40	1	3	4
41-45	0	0	0
46-50	1	1	2
51-55	1	0	1
56-60	2	0	2

Five respondents (out of a total of 20) interviewed were age 20-25 years old. This was followed by six respondents (out of 20) who were between the ages of 31-40.

Table 3

Educational Level of Respondents by Agency

Level of Education	Agency: Tuba City	Agency: Window Rock	Total
10 grade	0	1	1
11 grade	0	0	0
12 grade	7	4	11
1 yr. college	0	1	1
2 yr. college	2	3	5
3 yr. college	1	0	1
4 yr. college BS or BA	0	1	1

Eleven or over half of the respondents had a high school education. This was followed by six respondents who had one to two years of college.

Agency of Employment

Out of a total of 32 helping agencies from both cities of TC and WR area combined, the 20 respondents, who were selected randomly, are representatives of the following 13 agencies as listed below: Navajo Tribal Welfare (3); BIA Social Services (2); TWEP (3); ONEO Alcoholism Program (1); Community Health Representatives (2); Arizona State Department of Public Welfare (2); Chinle Extended Care Facility (1); BIA Employment Assistance (1); Public Employment Program (1); PHS Mental Health (1); BIA Law & Order (1); Arizona State Employment Office (1); ONEO Navajo Pre-Vocational Training Program (1).

Table 4

Length of Time Worked at Present Agency

	Agency		
Years Worked	Tuba City	Window Rock	Total
1 - 5 years	7	8	15
5 - 10 years	1	2	3
over 10 years	2	0	2

Of the 20 Navajo workers interviewed, their length of experience at their present agency varied from over one-half year to 31 years. Fifteen (or 75% of total respondents) had between one-half and five years of experience at the agency of their current employment. The longest length of employment for WR area was seven years and the longest length of employment for TC area is 31 years.

All 20 respondents (or 100% of total) from TC and WR area combined understood and spoke the Navajo language and could carry a conversation in Navajo fluently with the researcher.

Method of Data Analysis

An analysis of the respondent's questions to the three major areas in the interview guide was accomplished through means of narrative descriptions and comparisons, noting predominating trends and comparisons in consensus of responses as well as disparities in responses. Statistical and tabular correlations were made among these categories of respondents.

Summary

This chapter has detailed the focus and method of the study, and the biographical data associated with the research sample. Chapter IV will present the findings from the study, with comparisons of the data representative of TC and WR. Chapter V will be concerned with further analysis and with selected implications that flow from the findings. Finally, Chapter VI will present an overview, attempting to set the research findings into the context of the Navajo way of life.

Chapter IV

Research Findings

Introduction

This chapter presents the research findings. Initial attention is given to the 20 respondents descriptions of the most serious unmet needs of the Navajo clientele or population their agencies serve.

Secondly, it presents the findings relative to agency policy and procedures, and the data collected with respect to contemporary agency practice. Finally, this chapter will present some suggestions from the respondents as to how services can be improved.

Unmet Needs

The first question asked respondents under unmet needs was with respect to their views of what were the greatest needs of the Navajo people. All responses are tabulated below in Table 5.

Table 5

Needs as Seen by Navajo Respondents

	Agency		
Identified Needs	Tuba City	Window Rock	Total
Basic Survival Needs	8	12	20
Educational Needs	6	8	14
Employment Needs	12	6	18
Agency Supplied Needs	12	13	25

There were a total of 20 responses in this category, with eight of these coming from Tuba City and 12 from Window Rock. In the two cities combined the majority of all responses nine or (45% of total) indicate that the most pressing survival need is that of more adequate housing for the people. This is followed by four responses or 20% of total responses for both cities showing

need of water as a serious unmet survial need. Other categories of responses to unmet survival needs were: lower food prices (1); poor nutrition (1); lack of fuel and wood (1); overexposure to cold weather (1); more clothing needed (1); more food needed (2).

Education Needs

A total of fourteen responses from both Tuba City and Window Rock[2] combined indicated concern with education as an unmet need. A majority of eight responses (or 57% of all responses in this category from Tuba City and Window Rock combined) indicate concern with the serious lack of educational opportunities mainly for the secondary and college grade levels; including need for bi-lingual education, and Navajo history and culture oriented curriculum. Such courses would help to reinforce the validity of the common basis of the Navajo religion and its prescriptions and sanctions for culturally accepted behavior patterns. This would in turn enhance communication, respect and understanding for the younger generation Navajos of the ways of their elder kinfolks. Two respondents indicated a need for the above. Other categories of combined responses named "educational" problems as unmet needs, included: need for more Navajo Tribal Scholarship program (1); need for more adult basic education programs on the reservation, i.e., courses in reading and writing (1); need for more extensive programs to combat the school dropout problem among the Navajo youth (1).

Employment Needs

There were a combined total of 18 responses that cited employment related problems as an area of serious unmet needs of the Navajo people. The majority of combined responses, 12 or 67% of all responses, see the unemployment problem

---

[2]For the purpose of this paper, Tuba City and Window Rock will be abbreviated as TC and WR. Window Rock, for this purpose, includes the agencies also in Fort Defiance.

on the reservation as the most serious problem, i.e., the dearth of jobs on the reservation. Although 22% (4) of the total responses from both cities indicated a need for more vocational job training programs-the lower percentage in this category may be accounted for by the fact that job training programs are of little significance if there are no available jobs after the training is completed. Other responses in this category included: need for more industrial plants on the reservation to provide more jobs (1); the need for more Navajo Operated Businesses (1). It is interesting to note that two-thirds (or 12) of all 18 responses indicating employment-related problems as a serious unmet need came from the TC area. This could be accounted for by the fact that TC is a more rural, agrarian community with less industry and opportunity for gainful employment than is found in the more industrialized WR area.

Agency Supplied Needs

There were a combined total of 25 responses, the most highly rated category of all unmet need categories listing Agency Supplied Needs as largely not meeting the various needs of the Navajo people. For example seven or 28% of total responses list the need for increased welfare grants in all categories of assistance, in addition to agency offering help to families in the budgeting of their money.[3]

---

[3]Financial aid is the primary responsibilities of BIA Social Services and Arizona State Department of Public Welfare. Twenty per cent or five of the responses in this category listed the need for more governmental health facilities aiming toward better provision of acute and preventative care. Tuba City has one health facility-PHS hospital, and two small clinics; Window Rock has one PHS hospital, one private hospital and three health clinics. Outside of WR and TC the two cities of Shiprock and Chinle are the only cities on the Navajo reservation with a hospital. There are various small clinics scattered on the reservation, and a PHS hospital in Gallup, New Mexico (outside the reservation) but there's an obvious dearth of health services for the Navajos on their reservation. Health care is the responsibility of the U.S. Public Health Service.

In the next highest number of total responses in the area of agency supplied needs indicates a need for vehicles such as pick-up trucks to be considered an absolute survival need in computing amount of welfare assistance checks. These vehicles are used to haul livestock, wood, water, coal-supplies-get to and from winter and summer camps and to jobs in outlying areas, as well as to the trading posts and health facilities.

Three categories of unmet agency supplied needs were responded to by two responses each as outlined and explained below: (1) The need for help to families in more effective livestock and land use and management. (2) The need for more effective community development programs. (3) The need for more guidance and counseling programs. There is a particular need for more such services in the areas of alcoholism, family counseling, problem pregnancies....etc.[4]

Following the unmet need question, respondents were asked individually to list which unmet need (of all they have listed in question #1 - they considered to be the most important unmet need of them all. All answers were then tabulated and the results are indicated below in Table 6.

In terms of total responses from the respondents of TC and WR combined, the highest number of answers lists formal education as the top priority - with 25% (or five respondents) so indicating. This is followed by "employment-lack of jobs" seen as the second highest rated priority, with 20% (or four respondents) seeing this as the most important unmet need. It should be noted that all four respondents so signifying came from the Tuba City area (bearing out the need

---

[4] Several additional problem areas were responded to once each as unmet needs in which agencies could provide the service. They include (1) need for more law enforcement program personnel, i.e., tribal police, FBI criminal investigators (2) more emergency juvenile homes for both dependent and delinquent youth, (3) the need for improved road conditions, i.e., improving existing wagon trails into remote areas by paving them into passable roads (4) the need for more youth oriented services on the community level to promote involvement; prevent dropouts and delinquency.

for more jobs in their rural setting).

Table 6

Greatest or Highest Priority Needs

Identified Needs	Agency Tuba City	Agency Window Rock	Total
Basic Survival Needs	1	2	3
Education Needs	2	3	5
Employment Needs	4	0	4
Agency Supplied Needs	3	5	8

The next highest rated unmet need was that of need of increased welfare grants, with 15% (or three respondents) so indicating. This was followed by two of the total respondents rating each of the following categories as priority unmet needs: 1) improved housing, 2) need for improved modes of transportation. The following categories each received one response a priority unmet need: 1) electricity, heating and water shortage on the Navajo reservation, 2) need for juvenile home on reservation, 3) better health facilities, 4) need for guidance and counseling programs on the Navajo reservation.

Following the basic questions on needs the respondents were next asked what was the outcome, when needs were not met. See Table 7.

Table 7

Results of unmet physical need

Outcome of Unmet Needs	Agency Tuba City	Agency Window Rock	Total
Do not lose self-respect or pride-are used to it	7	2	9
Custodial Care becomes necessary	0	1	1
Becomes depressed, confused ashamed; family disorganization or suicide results	3	7	10

This table is designed to show the respondent's view of what happens to the Navajo people of their areas (TC & WR) when their basic, everyday survival needs are not supplied adequately. It should be noted that of the 10 TC respondents, 70% (or seven respondents) stated that even when these needs are not met there is no loss of self-respect or pride as their people have always had to contend with this way of life. This is contrasted to 70% (or seven respondents) from WR area as indicating this type of basic need deprivation of the Navajo people of their area is more likely to lead to depression, confusion, being ashamed, family disorganization and possibly suicide. One person from WR stated that custodial care becomes a necessity when physical needs of the Navajo people are not met.

Following the physical unmet need question, respondents were asked to whom Navajo people turn to for help if their everyday needs such as food, shelter and clothing are not met adequately. All answers are tabulated below in Table 8.

Table 8

To Whom do Navajos Turn for Help?

	Agency		
Resources used when in need	Tuba City	Window Rock	Total
Welfare Agency	6	6	12
Relatives	2	4	6
Themselves	2	0	2

There were a total of 20 responses in this category, with 10 of these coming from TC and 10 from WR. In the two cities combined, the majority of all responses 12 (or 60% of total) stated that Navajos turned to welfare agencies for help when their physical needs are not met adequately. This is followed by six respondents (or 30% of total) for both cities showing that the Navajo

people turn to their relatives for help when their food, shelter and clothing are inadequate. The remaining category, two responses (or 10% of total) of both cities stated that the Navajos turn to themselves, i.e., livestock when their physical needs are not met.

The Need for Increased Social Services

The next question the respondents were asked about was in respect to whether they saw a steadily increasing demand for social services on the Navajo reservation. The answer to this question is tabulated below in Table 9.

Table 9

Increasing Demand for Social Services

	Agency		
Responses	Tuba City	Window Rock	Total
Yes	10	9	19
No	0	1	1

In terms of total responses from the respondents of TC and WR combined, 95% (or 19 respondents) stated there was an increasing demand for social services on the Navajo reservation. The remaining 5% (or one respondent) felt there was enough social services, and would in fact work effectively if these services could be coordinated properly to avoid duplication of services.

Identified Areas Needing Increased Social Services

Following the question about the increasing demand for social services on the Navajo reservation, respondents were asked in what areas they felt these services were needed. The answer is tabulated in Table 10 into three major areas.

There were a combined total of three responses from TC and WR area citing that there was an indicated need for more services to supply the basic survival needs, i.e., food, shelter, and clothing. A total of three responses

from TC (& none from WR) indicated concern for needing more educationally oriented services for high school students, i.e., sex education (1); Career education planning (1); better over-all planned formal education curriculum to include Navajo history and other culture oriented curriculum (1).

The most highly rated category for increased demand for social services was that of agency supplied needs. There was a total of 35 respondents from both TC and WR under this category. Nine or 26% of total responses combined from both cities of TC and WR stated more increased social services in the area of Child Welfare and Family Services Program. The same number of respondents, nine (or 26% of toal responses) also cited a definite need for better and improved alcoholism programs. This program is currently under the auspices of ONEO. Eleven per cent or five of the responses in this category stated that the State Welfare program should be offering social services to Navajo clientele, in addition to it' financial assistance program. Specific services mentioned by respondents that ASDPW should provide are in relation to budgeting skills, guidance and counseling.

There were also four categories of increased demand for social services under Agency Supplied Needs (two responses each) as outlined below: improved road conditions and the need for more transportation for Navajo families; need for Food Preparation Program, increased welfare grants for the Navajos and need for a Juvenile Home on the Navajo Reservation.

Other additional problems identified as areas for increased social services were: (one response for each) need for a rehabilitation center for alcoholics on the Navajo reservation; need for PHS doctors to go into communities to give treatments; need for additional Maternity Homes on the Navajo reservation; need for a Red Cross program on the reservation; need for welfare agencies to find ways to meet the needs of Navajos who live in remote areas, i.e., Navajo Mountain area.

Table 10

Areas Needing Increased Social Services

Areas	Tuba City	Window Rock	Total
Food, Housing, and Clothing Needs	1	2	3
Educational Needs	3	0	3
Agency Supplied Needs	17	18	35

Operation and Policy Determination of Agencies

This section of the questionnaire relates to who operates agencies and sets policies that serve Navajo reservation clientele. The first question under this section asks respondents about who actually determines agency policy at their place of employment. This question asks specifically as to whether agency policies are set by Navajo or others. The answer is tabulated below in Table 11.

Table 11

Who sets Agency Policies?

	Agency		
Policies set by:	Tuba City	Window Rock	Total
Navajo	2	4	6
Non-Navajo	8	4	12
Mixed	0	2	2

There were a total of 20 respon s in this category. In the two cities combined, the majority of all responses 12 (or 60% of total) claimed that non-Navajos set agency policies within their agency of employment. Thirty per cent (or six respondents of total) stated that Navajos set agency policies within their place of work. The remaining 10% (or two responses of total) indicating that their agency policies were set by a mixture of both Navajos and non-Navajos.

What can the Non-Navajo offer the Navajo People?

The next question was in relation to the respondents opinion as to what they felt non-Navajos had to offer the Navajo people in the way of help. All answers were then tabulated and the results are indicated below in Table 12.

Table 12

What Areas can Non-Navajos be of Help?

Areas of Help	Agency Tuba City	Window Rock	Total
Consultants-offering ideas for exploration only & not necessarily for implementation	4	6	10
Nothing	4	4	8
Areas in Formal Education only	2	0	2

This table is designed to show the respondents' view to ways non-Navajos can be of help to the Navajo people. Ten responses (or 50% of total) combined from TC and WR viewed non-Navajo help only in terms of being consultants and offering ideas that do not necessarily have to be implemented. Eight respondents (or 40% of total responses) combined from both TC and WR felt non-Navajos had nothing to offer the Navajo people in terms of help. Two respondents (or 10% of total) felt non-Navajos can be of assistance to the Navajos only in a formal education setting, i.e., the regular public school structure.

Does Navajo Opinion Affect Agency Policy Formulation?

The third question under Agency operation asked respondents whether the opinions of the Navajo people were taken into consideration in the formulation of policy in relation to their agency. The results to this question are tabulated in Table 13.

Table 13

Is Navajo Opinion taken into Consideration in Formulation of Agency Policy?

Responses	Agency Tuba City	Window Rock	Total
Yes	6	6	12
No.	4	4	8

There were a total of 20 responses from the cities of TC and WR combined, the highest numbers of answers indicating that Navajo opinion was taken into consideration in formulation of policies in their agency - with 60% (or 12 respondents of total) so indicating. The remaining 40% (or eight respondents of total) from both cities of TC and WR stating that the Navajo opinion is not taken into consideration in relation to policy formulation of their agency.

Are there Channels to Express Dissatisfaction with Policy and to Change That Policy?

In the last question under Agency operation, respondents were asked for their opinion in respect to whether there was opportunity to express dissatisfaction with existing policy and effectively promote a change of that given policy. All answers to this view were tabulated below in Table 14.

Table 14

Are Expressions of Dissatisfaction Taken Into Consideration in Agency Policy Changes?

Responses	Agency Tuba City	Window Rock	Total
Yes, if channels are followed including: a Grievance Committee	4	7	11
No	6	3	9

There were a total of 20 responses in this category from both cities of TC and WR. Eleven responses (or 55% of total) indicated that agency policy can be

changed effectively if there is expression of dissatisfaction in this regard and if proper channels are followed. Nine (or 45% of total) respondents combined from both cities so indicating that agency policy cannot be changed regardless of the dissatisfaction expressed by workers of respondent's particular agency.

It should be noted that the majority of six respondents from TC area did not think agency policies can be changed regardless of the expression of dissatisfaction by workers. In contrast to this view, a majority (or seven respondents) from WR claim that agency policies can be changed if proper channels are followed.

Agencies Administrative Concerns

This section of questions relates to agency concerns such as jurisdictional and policy conflicts existing among the various agencies mentioned in the study. In addition the topic of Navajo Tribal Takeover, need for new or improved programs, effective qualities of social workers and program funding are discussed.

Do Jurisdictional and Policy Conflicts affect Provision of Services?

This question deals with whether jurisdictional and policy conflicts among the BIA, PHS, DPW, ONEO and the Navajo Tribe limit the ability of respondents to provide meaningful services to the Navajo people. The results of these questions are tabulated below in Table 15.

Table 15

Does Policy and Jurisdictional Conflict Among Agencies Limit Respondents Ability to Provide Meaningful Service?

	Agency		
Responses	Tuba City	Window Rock	Total
Yes	5	8	13
No	5	2	7

There were a total of 20 respondents for both TC and WR combined, with 13 respondents (or 65% of total) indicating that policy and jurisdictional conflict among the BIA, PHS, DPW, ONEO and the Navajo Tribe, as limiting their ability to provide reaningful services to the Navajo people. The remaining seven respondents (or 35% of total) combined from both cities of TC and WR stated that policy and jurisdictional conflict among agencies serving the Navajo people does not limit their ability to provide meaningful service to their people. It should be noted that eight (or 80% of total) respondents from WR area stated that policy and jurisdictional conflicts among the agencies they work with limit their ability to provide meaningful service to the Navajo people.

Recommendations for Solution

The 13 respondents (or 65% of total) of both cities from TC and WR who indicated that policy and jurisdictional conflict among BIA, PHS, ONEO and the Navajo Tribe limited their ability to provide meaningful service to their people were then asked for a recommendation for a solution to this problem. The results of the 13 respondents are tabulated below in Table 16.

Table 16

Solution for Agency Policy and Jurisdictional Conflicts

	Agency		
Recommendation for Solution	Tuba City	Window Rock	Total
Need more input from grass-root people for suggestions and solutions	1	0	1
Policies needs to be changed	0	1	1
Need more Inter-Agency meetings to understand each others Agency policies and to improve communication	4	7	11

The majority of the 13 respondents, 11 (or 86% of total) combined from both cities of TC and WR indicated that the solution to the agency policy and

and jurisdictional conflict between agencies is to have more inter-agency meetings to try to understand each others agency policies clearly and to improve communication. Other categories of responses to solution or recommendation to policy and jurisdictional conflict was: policy changes (1); need more input from grassroot people for suggestions and solutions (1).

If There are No Problems, How Do you Deal with Agencies?

Seven respondents (or 35% of total) from TC and WR combined who indicated they did not have problems with policy and jurisdictional conflict with other agencies were asked about how they dealt with the variety of agencies that exist. All answers of seven respondents are tabulated in Table 17.

Table 17

How Some Workers Avoid Policy and Jurisdictional Conflict Among Agencies

Worker's Methods	Agency Tuba City	Window Rock	Total
Other Agencies cooperate with us & vice-versa	3	2	5
I only do what is on my job description to avoid conflict	2	0	2

The majority of the seven respondents, five (or 71% of total) from both cities of TC and WR combined, stated that they avoided policy and jurisdictional conflict between their agency and other agencies because they cooperate with other agencies and vice-versa. The remaining two respondents (or 29% of total) indicated they did what was on their job description and did not think there was policy and jurisdictional conflict as long as they did what was on their job description.

Are there Advantages to Navajo Tribal Takeover?

The next question asks respondnets as to whether they see any advantages to the Navajo tribal takeover of the Bureau of Indian Affairs programs. All the answers to this question are tabulated in Table 18.

Table 18

Are there Advantages to Navajo Tribal Takeover?

Possible Responses	Agency Tuba City	Window Rock	Total
Yes	7	7	14
No	3	3	6

There were 20 respondents from TC and WR combined, of these 14 (or 70% of total responses) saw advantages to the Navajo Tribal Takeover. The remaining six respondents (or 30% of total) did not see any advantages to the Navajo Tribal Takeover.

The 14 respondents who saw advantages to the Navajo Tribal Takeover saw the following reasons as being advantages to the takeover; see Table 19 below for results:

Table 19

Advantages to Navajo Tribal Takeover

Advantages	Agency Tuba City	Window Rock	Total
Self-Determination: policies & programs will be made and controlled by Navajos	7	3	10
BIA & Tribal programs combined would serve more people and give better services to Navajos	2	1	3
Navajo worker & client would understand each other's problems better & make for better communication between Navajo people & agencies	5	2	7
Would mean more jobs on reservation for Navajos	5	4	9

Thus the 14 respondents listed 29 responses telling of the new advantages they saw in the Navajo tribal takeover. The majority of responses or 10

responses listed the major advantages as being promotion of self-determination of policies and programs on the Navajos for the Navajos. This was followed by nine responses indicating that there would be more jobs if a Navajo takeover would occur. The next highest number of responses, seven, indicate a better relationship would occur between client and worker-enhancing communication. The next number of responses, three, indicated Navajo tribal takeover would result in better overall service provision to the Navajo people.

Disadvantages to the Navajo Tribal Takeover

The next question related to what the 20 respondents viewed as being a disadvantage to the Navajo tribal takeover. All results of answers to this question is tabulated below in Table 20.

Table 20

Disadvantages to the Navajo Tribal Takeover

Disadvantages	Agency Tuba City	Window Rock	Total
Provides no replacement for physicians, lawyers, etc. Do not have enough Navajos that are ready to be administrators	3	9	12
Takeover will affect Fringe Benefits, Civil Service Status of BIA employees; will violate Equal Employment Opportunities & will invite more political & job discrimination	5	6	11
Too many Chiefs and not enough Indians	2	0	2
Government will probably withhold more of its funds to help the Navajos	4	0	4

Of the respondents answering that they saw a disadvantage to Navajo tribal takeover, there was a total of 29 responses from both cities of TC and WR combined. Twelve (or 41% of total responses) indicated that the Navajo tribal

takeover provides for no replacement of physicians, lawyers, non-Navajo ideas, and the Navajos also do not have enough of its tribal members that are ready to be administrators. Eleven (or 38% of total responses) cited that the Navajo tribal takeover will affect the BIA employees fringe benefits, civil service status and in addition, it will violate the Equal Employment Opportunity amendment. The 11 responses also stated that the Navajo tribal takeover will invite more political and job discrimination, as is common among the American society. Four responses (or 11% of total) combined from both cities of TC and WR indicated that federal funds might be withheld from the Navajos. The last category of disadvantages to the Navajo tribal takeover was responded to by two (or 7% of total) responses as that of having "Too many Chiefs and not enough Indians", i.e., too many administrators and not enough grassroot input.

Are There Programs you Would like to see Implemented or Improved?

Following the question of the disadvantage to the Navajo tribal takeover, respondents were asked about new programs they would like to see implemented under the tribal takeover, if it occurs. It should be noted that some of the programs mentioned by respondents may be in existence now, but respondents felt an improvement should be made in their service delivery areas. All list of programs that respondents felt should be implemented or improved are tabulated in Table 21.

There was a total of 36 responses from both TC and WR in regards to new programs respondents wish to see implemented under the tribal takeover. Eleven (or 31% of total responses) combined from both cities indicated a dire need for job training programs on the Navajo reservation and in addition to this, a program is needed to develop jobs for Navajos who have already trained for certain jobs. Ten responses (or 99% out of 11) who indicated a need for job training on the reservation were from the Tuba City area.

Table 21

New Programs Respondents would like to see Implemented or Improved

New Programs	Agency Tuba City	Window Rock	Total
Job training & finding job programs on reservation for Navajos	10	1	11
Improved Education programs	7	1	8
Juvenile & Alcoholism Rehabilitation Centers on Navajo Reservation	1	4	5
Programs to improve land management, transportation and road conditions	1	2	3
Need Food Stamp Program on reservation	1	0	1
Adequate Housing Program on reservation	1	0	1
Combine various agencies to avoid duplications	1	3	4
Home Health Care for Aged reservation wide	0	2	2
Mortuary on reservation	0	1	1

The next highest category of responses that relates to new programs needed on the Navajo reservation include eight responses (or 22% of total) indicating a need for better and improved educational programs in the areas of adult education, public safety program, GED programs, bi-cultural education program in public school systems and a need for more high schools on the Navajo reservation. Five responses (or 14% of total) claimed they would like to see new programs on the Navajo reservation in the areas of Juvenile and Alcoholism Rehabilitation centers. Four responses (or 11% of total) indicated they would like to see various agencies combined into one to avoid duplication of services, i.e., state welfare, tribal welfare and BIA social services. Three responses (or 8% of

of total) stated they would like to see programs that would improve land management, transportation and road conditions. Other categories included in new program implementation by respondents are as follows: Home Health Care for the aged reservation-wide (2); Food Stamp program on the reservation (1); adequate housing program on the reservation (1); mortuary on the Navajo reservation (1).

Is a College Education Necessary to be an Effective Worker Among the Navajo?

The next question asks for respondents view about whether a social worker in order to provide meaningful services to Navajos, needs a college education. All answers are tabulated below in Table 22.

Table 22

Is a College Education Necessary to Provide Meaningful Service?

	Agency		
Responses	Tuba City	Window Rock	Total
No, not necessarily	4	7	11
Yes	6	3	9

There were a total of 20 respondents from TC and WR combined, of which 11 (or 55% of total) responses indicating that a college education was not necessary in order to provide meaningful services to the Navajo people. The remaining nine respondents (or 45% of total) from both cities of WR and TC stated that a college education was helpful in providing meaningful service to the Navajos. It is noteworthy that the majority of respondents, seven, from WR area stated that a college education was not necessary in providing meaningful service to the Navajo people. In contrast to this view, the majority of respondents, six, from TC area think that a college is not only necessary, but helpful in being an effective worker among the Navajo people.

What are the Personal Qualities that make a Worker Effective Among the Navajo People?

After the question following the necessity of a social worker to have a college education, respondents were asked for their view of what personal qualities a person should have in order to adequately relate to and be of service to the Navajos. All answers are shown below in Table 23.

Table 23

Personal Qualities a Social Worker should have in order to relate to and be of service to Navajos

Personal Qualities	Agency: Tuba City	Agency: Window Rock	Total
Understanding of Navajo Ways, Language & Culture	23	14	37
Patient & Receptive-Humanitarian in approach & Genuine	13	13	26
Provide Tangible Services to Navajos	1	1	2

There was a total of 65 responses from TC and WR in regards to what kind of personal qualities a person has to have in order to be an effective worker and be able to provide meaningful service to the Navajo people.

The majority of responses 37 (or 57% of total) combined from both cities of TC and WR indicating that a person that is going to provide meaningful service to the Navajo people has to be a Navajo who speaks the Navajo language, knows their life style and culture. This person also has to have respect for clan membership and has to experience the problems of the Navajos in order to understand the Navajos and to provide adequate service to them. Out of the 37 responses who indicated the necessity of understanding the Navajo language, their ways, culture and being a Navajo as a necessary personal quality of a meaningful and effective social worker, 23 responses (or 62% of total) were from Tuba City area.

Twenty-six responses (or 40% of total) combined from both TC and WR

indicated a person who can relate and provide meaningful service to the Navajo people has to be patient, receptive, humanitarian in approach and be genuine. This is followed by two responses (or 3% of total) combined from both cities of TC and WR, who claim that one has to provide something tangible for the Navajo people in order to be an effective social worker with the Navajos. This means not to be only sympathetic, but to actually provide concrete services.

Are these qualities the same for both Navajo and Non-Navajo?

Respondents were next asked for their view as to whether the personal qualities they had mentioned above are needed for both Navajo and non-Navajo persons. All answers to this question are tabulated below in Table 24.

Table 24

Should Personal Qualities Apply to both Navajo and Non-Navajo Persons?

Possible Responses	Agency: Tuba City	Agency: Window Rock	Total
Yes, with understanding that Non-Navajos understand Navajo ways of life and can be used only as resource persons	5	5	10
No, "stay out", had too many bad experiences with non-Navajos (specifically Anglos)	5	5	10

There were a total of 20 respondents from both cities of TC and WR combined of which 10 (or 50% of total respondents) indicated that the personal qualities as shown in Table 23 can be applied to both Navajo and non-Navajo persons with the understanding that they know the Navajo ways of life, their language and that they would be used only as resource persons. The remaining 10 respondents (or 50% of total) did not think non-Navajos and Navajos have the same personal qualities as that shown in Table 23 - seen as needed to effectively work with the Navajo people. These respondents claimed they wanted non-Navajos to "stay

out" of the helping professions with their people because they had had too many bad experiences with non-Navajos.

What should be the Funding Source of Social Service Programs?

The last question the respondents were asked was about where they felt funds to operate a social services program should come from. All answers are tabulated by researcher in Table 25.

Table 25

Where should Funds to Operate Social Services Programs come from?

	Agency		
Sources of Funds	Tuba City	Window Rock	Total
Federal Government	11	10	21
State Governments	6	7	13
Tribal Government	2	3	5
Private Donors	1	1	2
Combined Federal & State	0	1	1

There were a total of 41 responses from TC and WR combined of which 21 indicated that funds to operate a social service program on the Navajo reservation should come from the federal government. The next highest category of respondents opinions about where funds for social service programs should come from was from the state governments. Respondents each mentioned that the state only counted them in population for funding but does not provide services to them once monies are appropriated to the state. Respondents claim they would like to see the states take on more responsibilities in way of funds and giving services to the Navajos.

Five responses (or 12% of total) from both cities stated the Navajo tribal government should give more funds for social services on the Navajo reservation. Other categories mentioned as to where funds should come from are as follows: private donors (2); combined federal and state monies (1).

Summary

This chapter has presented the ideas of 20 Navajo workers about the needs of the Navajos, the present agency structure and suggested changes. Main attention was given to the major unmet needs of the Navajo people, including in ranked priority: (1) agency supplied needs; (2) basic survival needs; (3) employment needs; (4) educational needs.

Navajos respondents see that non-Navajos are setting agency policies. They feel non-Navajos should serve only in the capacity of consultant, or not to try to "help" at all. Most respondents felt that Navajo opinion does affect agency policy formulation; and yet they are almost evenly divided as to whether grievances can be redressed or not. Respondents also felt that service is hindered because of inter-agency conflict, and communication needs to be improved among agencies. A majority of respondents feel there are major advantages to a Navajo tribal takeover of Navajo related programs and planning.

It is felt that improved and new programs are needed on the Navajo reservation mainly in the areas of job training and development and improved educational programs. A college education was not seen as a necessity in order to work effectively with the Navajo. Being Navajo, knowing the language, culture and being patient and humanitarian in approach are important qualities to have in working effectively with the Navajo people.

It is also felt by a majority of the respondents that the funding of social service programs should primarily be by the Federal government, followed by the state government.

Chapter V

IMPLICATIONS OF THE DATA

Introduction

This study was an exploratory study designed to assess in what ways the Navajo caseworker respondents were aware of the problems faced by the clientele their agencies serve, i.e., the Navajo people.

The design of the study was in the format of an open-ended interview which was conducted with 20 respondents from 13 traditional agencies in the two cities of Tuba City and Window Rock, Arizona. It was pointed out in Chapter III that responses from the caseworkers of these two different cities would most likely vary because of the differing life styles of those two cities: Tuba City representing the agrarian, livestock economy; Window Rock representing the more urban life style.

The interviews centered around three major areas:

1. Unmet needs of the Navajo clientle as interpreted by their Navajo caseworkers.
2. Effectiveness of present service delivery systems of the 13 "traditional" agencies as seen by the Navajo caseworkers.
3. Perceptions of questions of funding, administration, and control and program development among the agencies as seen by the Navajo caseworkers.

Although there were many findings within the analysis of the data, to list all of them and their implications here is beyond the scope and purpose of this chapter. Therefore, selected issues will be raised and an interpretation given as to the implications of these major findings for the Navajo people. The categories selected will be discussed separately under the topical headings as follows: (1) Educational needs, (2) Employment needs and (3) Agency supplied needs.

Unmet Needs

I. Educational Needs

The majority of responses in this category indicate a concern for the present serious lack of educational opportunities mainly for the secondary and college grade levels; including the need for bi-lingual education, Navajo history and culture oriented curriculum.

At the age of five or six years, when psychoanalytic studies indicate that the child is most in need of parental guidance and support, the Navajo youngster is forced to leave his parental home and to attend a federally subsidized boarding school, at least many miles or even out-of-state from the parental home. He is immersed into a totally strange way of life in which he is punished for values that he has never learned and praised for conforming to ideals that are alien to him. He is forced to speak a language that is very difficult to learn, and often is punished for using his native tongue. Along with the loss of his language, he is now told that the Gods his family has worshipped for centuries are not valid and he must attend church to worship one God. He is told the practices and beliefs of his people were mere superstitious beliefs. The heroes he learns about are the heroes of the whiteman. It is not unknown for a whole group of young Indian children to jump and to cheer for the calvary against Indian attacks without understanding the reason the Indians felt forced to defend their land. Due to their parents financial and transportation problems, very few of these children have the opportunity to visit their families more than twice a month, and some never see their parents during the school year. The molding effect of parental guidance and the transmission of cultural guidance is thus diminished and replaced by an en loco parentis situation in which the boarding school home becomes the Great White Father. It is not uncommon for children who rebel against the loss of the parents language,

culture and beliefs, to be severely punished through such things as washing toilets, standing on ones knees for hours, not being allowed to go home on weekends or being denied recreational trips with others. Carried to an extreme, this "rebel" child may even be forced into psychiatric consultation to see what is causing his "acting-out pathological behavior."

The same cultural annihilation continues through out secondary school. That the cultural beliefs and traditions of the Navajo people have persisted through out this annihilative syndrome gives testimony to the Navajo people, as having a "persistent cultural system", resistant to outside changes and influences. Could this latter fact be recognized and utilized in core curriculum content, the result would be highly beneficial to the Navajo children themselves. Nothing, however, can replace one's parents; an alternative to the boarding school situation must be found. The tragedy of conformity is cultural marginality among one's own people.

For the children residing in Tuba City, Window Rock, Chinle, Ganado and other cities on the Navajo reservation, going to boarding school is not such a traumatic experience, as they can easily return home to their parents. The problem remains acute, however, for children whose parents live in extremely remote areas of the reservation. For these children, it is recommended that a series of satellite residentual schools be established in which children could live in a cottage arrangement with Navajo houseparents to serve as their substitute family and with no more than 10 children per cottage. In conjunction with this living arrangement, the curriculum should be bi-lingual and arranged so that each child would have ample opportunity and transportative means for returning to his parental home for regularly scheduled and frequent visitations. The arrangement should, also apply for high school education programs. This, along with the acknowledgement of the value of the native culture, would enhance

the pride of the Navajo in himself, would make school more palatable to the youngster and more relevant to the Navajo people. It follows that the dropout and delinquency rates would most likely decline.

In so far as college education is concerned, there is a need to train people to assume responsible roles in a manner which will make their occupations relevant to the reservation itself. All too often one is trained in a skill - obtains a degree, and returns home to the reservation only to find there is no need for his skill and training. Many young Navajos have difficulty in seeing what relevance white university higher educational material has to their people back home. The expansion of a college such as the Navajo Community College, which is run by and relevant to the Navajo people is a vital necessity.

II. Employment Needs

One of the most serious unmet needs of the Navajo people as seen by the respondents in this study was that on unemployment. They cited a need for more available jobs on the reservation, more vocational training and active job development programs, as well as more industrial plants to provide jobs as was pointed out in Chapter III. This problem was more acute in the Tuba City area, than for the industrial areas of Window Rock.

Of the state welfare and BIA general assistance programs, a total of 60% of all Navajo people are on one of the other two of these programs. Excluding the 12% that are on AFDC, the 7% of OAA and the 7% of the APTD, this leaves a total of 34% that are able-bodied males that are receiving BIA welfare subsidies due to lack of available jobs. The state welfare programs will not assist able-bodied men and their families with welfare benefits. The BIA welfare program, however, does subsidize able-bodied men and their families with the following stipulation: that a male in question prove that he is applying for employment at least every two weeks or that he is working on the TWEP (Tribal

Work Experience Program) project. The TWEP project subsidizes an individual with $30.00 a month ($1.50 a day) for 40 hours a week. Work such as community projects, i.e., repairing fences, fixing roofs, building hogans, constitutes the TWEP employment program. This allows the individual to remain in his community while he can still retain his welfare check from the BIA. Unfortunately, there is no program included in TWEP which allows the able-bodied male a means of upward mobility out of the poverty cycle. In other words, there are relatively few available jobs for him to take to get out of the TWEP program and vocational training programs for the existing jobs are equally as scarce on the reservation. There are relocation programs under the BIA Employment Assistance which will take an individual to another city to train him for jobs in that area, but there are many competetive qualifications necessary to get this opportunity and the end result is that you must leave the land and your people and not take your skills back home to them where they are desperately needed because jobs are non-existent there. Also, you get just one chance to go on employment assistance training. In spite of the fact that the projects completed under TWEP do benefit certain people, it does appear to be a rationale for simply justifying receiving financial assistance. The result is a dead-end street for an able-bodied Navajo male with resulting poverty and frustration leading to family disorganization, illness, alcoholism and a feeling of worthliness with no solution in sight.[5]

---

[5]To further lock these people into the poverty cycle is the existence of the trading post monopoly over their meager income. There are no large chain or discount stores to force competitive lower prices for such necessities as food and clothing, and the trading post, therefore has a monopoly over the entire consumer market - other than the city of Window Rock, which has a Fedmart Store. It is quite common to have a Navajo family give their entire welfare check to the trading post in addition to handcrafted items such as jewelry, and rugs, to pay for their bare necessities. The trading post will in turn mark-up these handcraft items, sometimes up to 150% and will assume the profit with the Navajo person getting nothing, except application to his credit for the items. In fact at one time these handcraft items as well as the livestock of the Navajo people - items of cultural value and survival - were even counted as income against them in computing the amounts of their welfare grants.

In the Tuba City area, the land dispute between the Navajo-Hopi, the Executive Order of 1882, is impeding the development of any industrial growth and job development. The residents of this area are merely in limbo and in a maze of legal disputes which could forseeably continue for years.

To remedy the situation of dire unemployment on the reservation there is a need of a multi-pronged attack which would include federally funded adult basic education programs, vocational programs and a community organized - land development program. The unemployed male should be the focus of the effort with opportunity to learn such practical skills as auto mechanics, carpentry, plumbing, etc. It is even possible that recreational parks and shops should be developed and maintained to promote tourism which would bring income to the reservation. It would give the women of the reservation an opportunity to create their native handcraft for direct sale to tourists without the middleman of the trading post. The women could also be utilized in schools to give demonstration of methodology of the handcraft (and the legends so vital to their creation) - to the younger Navajo women.

Vocational training facilities could be set up in what are now the existing boarding schools upon the reservation. Part of such training could be to teach young Navajo men advanced courses in "how to manage his own business". An end result could be the federal financing of such business that are owned and operated by the Navajo man on his own reservation. The federal financing would be the initial capital outlay with consultants serving to help the young businessman initially but with no other strings attached, other than that the business be a feasible and practical endeavor.

Many Navajo women would also benefit by vocational training such as in secretarial and nursing or hospital related fields. As was pointed out before, with possibly one exception, there are no vocational training outlets upon the Navajo reservation at this time.

The high school youth that is motivated to go to college may be bitterly disappointed to learn that there are not enough scholarships to go around - the Navajo youth have a great respect for education as is shown in Chapter IV. Education is seen as a means for getting out of the unemployment-poverty cycle. The tribe and federal government should investigate all means of supplying full college scholarships to any aspiring young Navajo wishing to achieve higher education.

Tuba City's problem of unemployment will probably persist as long as the land dispute continues between the Navajo and Hopis. It is hoped that the two tribes will be left or allowed to settle this dispute between themselves without outside governmental arbitration or influences.

III. Agency Supplied Needs

This extensive area received a great deal of response particularly around unmet needs such as the need for higher welfare grants, better health facilities, adequate housing, improved community programs, counseling and guidance programs, livestock and land management, etc. Each of these issues are vital and many pages could be devoted to subjective interpretation of each of these needs individually. At this point, however, that the Indian population on the Navajo reservation lives in a situation of dire poverty which complicates every aspect of their lives. If this cycle is to ever be broken, a great many more services will have to be provided by the various agencies that serve the Navajo people. Integral to provision of these services is the need for Navajo self-determination of his priorities and the method of delivery which would surely be the result of the Navajo tribal takeover. The Navajo people no longer are willing to be voiceless objects and recipients of agency policies, programs and handouts. Navajo people must have a voice in the programs that are going to destine and shape their life style. The Navajo tribal takeover is one step toward the accomplishment of these ends.

Summary

In conclusion, this chapter has attempted to give the reader an insight into several major areas of the total data collection. The primary unmet needs of the Navajo people revolved around their educational needs, employment needs and the various listed agency supplied needs. All of these needs are inter-related forcing the Navajo into a situation of poverty and dependency upon the federal government. If an all out effort can be made to meet these needs with the input of Navajo self-determination, many centuries of injustice will be corrected.

Chapter VI

CULTURAL EXPERIENCES AND THEIR RELEVANCE

Introduction

In conclusion to this study, it is felt that there is a need to highlight the respondents statements that the non-Navajo cannot be as effective working with Navajo people as can be the Navajo. A great deal is lost in lack of understanding of cultural difference and in not sharing the Navajo language.

The respondents also pointed out that the non-Navajo can constructively be used as a consultant to the Navajo, and therefore, this section shall include a description of the quality that an effective non-Navajo consultant should possess. This is based upon the respondents data and the researcher's own personal acquaintance of such a person.

Finally, attention will be given to a brief overview of the Navajo way of life; a portrayal of the life, the feeling and the pride of being Navajo.

This chapter overall will attempt to show that many of the problems cannot be solved unless they are set in the context of the culture of the Navajo.

Religion

Despite every good intention of the well meaning social worker or anyone working with a Navajo in a helping manner, time has proven that good intentions are not enough, and in fact at times can prove to be harmful to the person being "helped". For example, over half of the Navajo people are official members of the Native American Church (NAC) in which part of the religious sacrament is the use of the "drug" known as peyote. Peyote is used as a means of achieving a state of communication with the Gods. It is considered a sacrament within the church to be used by a person who exercises a great deal of self-control and discipline over the effect of the peyote.

Historically, many Navajos have been arrested while in the middle of their church ceremony for using this "drug". In one instance, a young man was labeled by an Anglo psychiatrist as schizophrenic with the symptoms of visual hallucinations and fixed delusions and shortly after was sent to an off reservation hospital. He had simply not exercised appropriate self-discipline in his religious use of peyote, a problem which could have been handled by himself or in discussion with another church member. The man has since returned home, and is obviously in full possession of his mental faculties.[6]

Mental Health

A young Navajo girl was brought into a traditional urban psychiatric setting for help because she was acting in a very disturbed and upset manner. The non-Navajo social worker involved with this girl was able to get the girl to come inside and both spoke English, so the language barrier did not seem to be a serious problem. The girl poured out some of her feelings of depression and loneliness since the death of her father and it got to the point in the interview where the girl was ready to let her heart out to someone who understood. The girl turned to the social worker and said, "I have met the coyote and have seen him face to face, he has taken my hand and we have walked off into the mountain. We have become friends and I want to be with him always." The social worker was at a loss as to what the coyote meant and upon asking the girl what she meant by "coyote" something was lost from their rapport. The girl simply shrugged her shoulders and became uncommunicable once again. The girl began to plead, "let me return to my people and home, where they will know how to treat me". The social worker and psychiatrist ordered tranquilizers for the girl and set up an appoint-

---

[6] This illustration, and others that follow in this Chapter, are based substantially in fact. The circumstances cited, however, have been altered to avoid identification of specific persons.

ment for out-patient therapy in spite of the girls pleading, "just send me home".

This case is an example of the harm that a helping person, who is non-Navajo, can do due to lack of cultural understanding of the Navajo belief. A Navajo practioner would have recognized the "coyote" as being a warning from the girl that she wanted to die. To the Navajo, a coyote can be a warning of impending tragedy, death or evil or even witchcraft. This girl could most definitely have been considered suicidal because she had made "friends" with the coyote and he had walked with her into the mountains for good.

The girl was disturbed in that the Navajo does not make "friends" with the coyote and this showed a distortion of her cultural belief. The treatment of choice would have been to have first taken her to the handtrembler who could have diagnosed her illness and recommended a specific medicine man to perform a ceremony that wards off evil spirits in which she has certain specific tasks to perform which will help her work through her feelings and fear. This treatment may well have worked because it was culturally relevant to her whole being and was the way she was brought up to believe she could be cured.

Employment

A young Navajo gentleman, wife and three children had waited many years for the opportunity for him to enter a training program. The opportunity arrived and the family was transferred from their home to a city in another state on a relocation program. The man completed the training program successfully and showed great promise for his trade. Because of his excellent record, the young man was immediately hired into a job and received a higher salary than he had ever known was possible. He and his wife rented a home, purchased a car and the children were enrolled in school. He had not yet accrued vacation or sick leave but he was able to spend weekends on family outings. One Sunday night he

and his family were driving home from a trip to the country when both husband and wife saw a ghost on the highway. To the Navajo, the seeing of a ghost is a bad omen of impending tragedy occuring within the next four days or in the near future if nothing is done to prevent this from happening. The Navajo must return to his home to meet with the handtrembler or star gazer and have the meaning of the ghost diagnosed, and to have a certain ceremony performed for him and his wife to counteract the danger they are in or the witchcraft spell they have been put under.

This particular young man and his family called his new employer the next morning to explain that he and his wife had seen a ghost the night before on the road, that they had to return home immediately to have a certain ceremony performed to help them. The employer laughed out loud and told them that if he had not been drinking so heavily that they would not have seen anything like that and that no ghost could be an excuse for a hangover. When it became apparent that the young man was serious about being gone for several days, the employer said that if he did not show up to work that very day, he might as well give us his job, that he could not tolerate a drinking problem accompanied by "silly superstitious belief" when there was work to be done. The young man and his family returned home totally disillusioned with their experience and never again to accept an offer for relocation or training.

Legal Services

Many years ago upon the Navajo reservation, a young Navajo couple with one child were having some family difficulties and a non-Navajo person became involved with their case and made the decision himself that the child should be removed from this family. There was an interpreter who helped arrange for the planning for this event. Whether it was the persons inadequate explanation to the interpreter or the interpreters lack of understanding of the situation is not known.

The family had been told that the child was going to be temporarily placed into a foster home until the family could work their problems out. They were given a document in English to show they approved of the plan by signing it. They could not, however, read English, and they had no reason to doubt the person would give their child back soon. They put their thumbprint upon the document, as they could not write English either. The child was removed from their home and has never been returned. What the family had signed was relinquishment papers for their child.

Summary: The Need to Understand

Above have been listed four examples of the harm that could be done to a Navajo person through lack of understanding of his culture and his language. It suggests further why it is difficult for the Navajo to assimilate into a whiteman's world. By these examples given above one can see the need for several services which could have alleviated the problem. The psychiatrist and social worker dealing with the man using peyote and the girl seeing the coyote would have benefited greatly from the services of a Navajo roadman or medicine man.

Traditional ceremonies to ward off affects of witchcraft and evils are quite expensive and many families do not have funds to finance such ceremonies. If the National Institute of Mental Health (NIMH) wishes to promote better mental health centers among the Navajo people, they could finance mental health centers upon the reservation which would include not only the traditional psychiatrist as a consultant, but Navajo social workers and Navajo lay mental health technicians. The most important therapist for the center would be the traditional medicine man who would be equipped to grant families sums of money to finance ceremonials that are necessary to achieve mental well being, and to perform their traditional role for them.

For example of the man who lost his job gives evidence to the need of relocation program administrators screening future employers of Navajo trainees to

make certain that the employer appreciates and at least is willing to learn and accept a different culture and way of life than his own.

Had legal services been available to the man and woman who lost their child, the tragedy for this family could have been avoided. Legal services are now available to the Navajo people under the DNA[7] program in which the componentency of attorneys serving the people is supplemented by Navajo counselors. There is a need for expansion of such services, both in civil, contractual, and consumer protection as well as class-action suits such as protection of land gain from Navajo treaties signed from the federal government, and to lobby for all the needed services of the Navajo on a class-action basis.

The above illustrates that to work effectively with the Navajo takes a particular type of person. It has already been discussed in depth why the Navajo work better with the Navajo on the reservation. The non-Navajo can have alot to offer the Navajo people in a consultative manner, - or even off the reservation in the following ways: understanding of the plight of the Navajo and lobbying on his behalf; in writing proposals that will directly benefit Navajo people, acting as consultant and offering expertise in research and program development.

The following will give the reader an example of a non-Navajo, Anglo male that is working effectively as a supervisor/consultant within the Navajo reservation. This person has gained the respect of his Navajo workers - as well as the respect of the Navajo clients of his agency, and the Navajo people that know him. The qualities that this man possesses should serve as an example to other non-Navajos who want to work effectively with the Navajo people. These

---

[7]Dinebeiina Nahiilna De Agaditahe meaning Attorneys for the revitalization of the livelihood of the Navajo people.

qualities are listed below:

1. Highly qualified in educational background.
2. Does not impose Anglo viewpoints or value system on others.
3. People come before bureaucratic policies.
4. Searches for Navajo ideas, listens to their input and implements their suggestions.
5. Allows for creativity and growth in workers, allows them to do special projects and advises them.
6. Has courage to take a stand and to back up his employees when in difficulty.
7. Workers feel free to express anger to and to criticize and he does not become angry or defensive.
8. Workers allow him to criticize them because they respect his criticism.
9. Admits to his own limitations that he cannot work as effectively in a one to one or one to family setting with the Navajos as can Navajos.
10. Is highly visable within the Navajo community, shares in the hardships and responsibilities of the lives of the people. His wife and children support him in this.
11. Becomes involved with the people and their culture, is willing to learn, cares.
12. Is willing to socialize with the Navajo people and workers. Puts himself above no person. Invites workers and clients to his home and they reciprocate.
13. Has the best interests of the Navajo people at heart.
14. Workers can be honest and open with him.

A Final Note: To Be A Navajo

To be a Navajo is to be born as a Navajo, live in a hogan, speak the native tongue and to be disciplined by Navajo Gods known as the Holy People. The Holy People are Gods who gave instructions to the Navajo people for social conduct, for planting, for weaving, for basketweaving, how to behave in a definite way towards all persons addressed by the same kinship terms (clans), for the many

ceremonials that are performed. These instructions are handed down in legend stories from one generation of Navajos to the next generation. The Navajo people are believed to have come from the underworld and progressed through four layers of worlds before they came upon the Earth. The Holy People are believed to have inhabited the earth before the Navajos and have discovered the best ways of living on it. The Holy People sanctions are at the everyday level affecting all phases of life by which the Navajos live. Even Navajo games have a ritual context and have to be played at the right time in order to bring good to the Navajo. Good is considered to be of greater value than evil or bad. In order to be good, a Navajo must value human relations and follow the teachings of the Holy People in order to keep in harmony with the rest of the Navajo people and nature.

A Navajo child is not taught individual responsibility, but rather more of a group responsibility since relatives are the focal points of the Navajos human world. A Navajo is taught to help one's relatives/neighbors - this kind of social organization counteracts possible isolation and helplessness of family groups living at such distance from each other.

For a Navajo, life is hard, therefore, everyone has to work hard for the family survival, i.e., haul wood, water, plant crops, etc. The Navajo economy is an economy of scarcity. Water sources are far apart and sometimes crops may fail to grow due to lack of rain or may be ruined by late or early frost. One has to go to a nearby trading post or city for groceries and not all families have transportation for all the necessities that needs transportation. There are also few Navajo families who have electricity and running water. Livestock is the Navajos primary economy; sheepskin is used for bedding and sheepmeat is the Navajos steak.

A Navajo child is considered and treated like a small adult at a young age. He is usually sent out with the flocks around six or seven years old. Children

are rewarded by a gift of lamb, kid, or new clothes from the trading post when parents can afford them. Herding sheep is not considered doing a job for the family since many young Navajo children own some sheep, goats, horses and sometimes cattle. So it is at an early age that a Navajo child begins to learn how to look after his personal property. Shortly after this, girls and boys are trained certain skills by elders of the same sex. Girls learn skills such as: how to card, spin, weave and grind corn. The boys are taught skills such as: how to care for horses and other livestock, how to plant and protect crops from crows, how to build a house or hogan, how to hunt for rabbits and prairie dogs and so forth.

A Navajo child is taught to become strong by rubbing an alive toad on his chest, rolling in the snow and running to the east early in the morning when the morning god (Hashch'e'elti') is around and will reward him.

A Navajo child is taught to follow the advice of his parents and never to talk back, but his individual decisions are at the same time respected. General discipline is received from the mothers side of the family since Navajo is a matrilineal society. Discipline is also done through fear of the supernatural beings, i.e., the Yeibichai. If a Navajo child misbehaves, he is told that a Yeibichai will carry him off and eat him. Navajo children are also taught there are such things as witchcraft and ghosts. A Navajo child is taught to fear death since that is the end of all good things and the Navajos do not believe in life after death. A child is also taught to be cautious around animals, i.e., owls, bears and coyotes because these animals represent bad luck. Navajos are taught not to burn snakes, toads, and so forth because it can affect one's mind.

If a Navajo gets sick, his illness is diagnosed by a handtrembler or star gazer. The illness relating to his sickness can normally be cured by a medicine

man, especially those relating to mental health. The Navajo ceremonies are performed to attract the good so that evils can be warded off and also for purification - dispelling the evils that have already encroached.

The Navajo people believe human beings have an outer form and an inner form; the latter is believed to be independent of the outer form and therefore controls the inner form (that which stands within one). "That which stands within one" (Wind) is by which the Navajos believe human beings breathe and also by which they have life. "That which stands within one" is believed to be determined by the kind of wind that comes within a person at birth and gives him life and which determines what kind of person he is going to be. An example of how "that which stands within one" works - sometimes one will hear a Navajo say "It is not me acting this way but the wind that is possessing me".

The Navajos are taught to believe that certain specific behaviors lead to mental illness, i.e., the rim design of a ceremonial/wedding basket is never closed because this could cause a person to lose his mind; another specific behavior leading to mental illness is incest; others relate to witchcraft and ghostly influence, animal related illness and so forth. The conception of these illnesses and their treatment (cure) go together in the Navajo Way so it is difficult to cure with methods that do not fit the belief of the person that is ill.

Today, being a Navajo means to have your personality shaped by the conditions at home, by school years and mostly by the demands of whitemen. But a Navajo will never forget the teachings of his people:

> Long ago in the underworld, there existed mountains knows as San Francisco Peak, Sierra Blanca Peak, La Plata Mountain and Mount Taylor.
>
> First Man and First Woman aka Changing Woman instructed the Navajo that when they came upon what is known as Earth, they were to search for these Sacred Mountains. So it was thus predestined from the

beginning by First Man and First Woman that the Sacred Mountains were placed in the fifth world (Earth) as the boundaries of the area the Navajo people were destined to inhabit. In accordance with it we live, in the midst of these four Sacred Mountains, as "The Navajo People" the heart of Mother Earth.

REFERENCES

Department of Health, Education and Welfare, Letter to Arizona State Department of Public Welfare, Dated 3-30-66, 50 Fulton Street, San Francisco, California.

Hester, J. J. Early Navajo Migration and Acculturation in the Southwest. Santa Fe: Museum of New Mexico Press, 1962.

Kelly, L. C. The Navajo Indians and Federal Indian Policy, 1900-1935. Tucson: University of Arizona Press, 1968.

Link, M. A. Navajo: A Century of Progress, 1868-1968. Window Rock: K. C. Publications, 1968.

Old Mexican. Old Mexican, Navajo Indian 1865 - ?. New York: Johnson Reprint Co., 1947.

Phelps - Stokes Fund. The Navajo Indian Problem. New York, 1939.

Shepardson, M. Navajo Ways in Government; a Study in Political Process. Menasha Wis.: American Anthropological Assoc, 1963.

United States Government. Bureau of Indian Affairs Welfare Manual. Washington D.C. 1952.

Wolf, R. C. Needed: a system of income maintenance for Indians. Arizona Law Review. Vol. 10, 1968.

Young, R. W., Morgan, W. Navajo Historical Selections. Phoenix Indian School Phoenix Indian School Printshop, 1954.

Young, R. W. The Role of the Navajo in the Southwestern Drama. Gallup: Gallup Independent, 1968.

Young, R. W. The Navajo Yearbook, Window Rock, 1961

APPENDIX A

INTERVIEW GUIDE

SOCIAL WELFARE PROBLEMS OF THE NAVAJO NATION: A PERCEPTUAL STUDY OF SOCIAL WELFARE NEEDS

BIOGRAPHICAL INFORMATION

Sex: **Agency:**

Age: **Length of time worked:**

Education: **Navajo speaking:**

I. UNMET NEEDS

1. In your opinion, what are the greatest needs for the Navajo people?

2. Of all the needs you mentioned, which one do you consider to be the most important unmet need?

3. What happens to Navajos who do not have everyday needs such as food, shelter and clothing met adequately? To whom do they turn for help?

Do you see a steadily increasing demand for social services on the Navajo reservation? If so, in what areas or ways?

II. WHO OPERATES AGENCIES AND SET POLICIES?

1. Who determines the agency policies, by this I mean Navajo or others?

2. What do you feel non-Navajos' have to offer the Navajo people in way of helping our people?

3. Is the opinion of the Navajo people taken into consideration in formulation of policy in relation to your agency?

4. Is there any opportunity to express dissatisfaction with existing policy and effectively promote a change of that given policy?

III. AGENCIES ADMINISTRATIVE CONCERNS

1. Do policy and jurisdictional conflicts among the Bureau of Indian Affairs, Public Health Services, State Welfare, Office of Navajo Economic Opportunity and the Navajo Tribe limit your ability to provide meaningful service to the Navajo people? If so,

   a. Do you have a recommendation for a solution to this problem?

   b. If no, how do you deal with the variety of agencies that exist?

2. Do you see any advantages to the Navajo tribal takeover?

3. Do you see any disadvantages to the Navajo tribal takeover?

4. Are there any new programs you would like to see implemented?

5. Do you feel a social worker in order to provide meaningful service to Navajos, needs a college education?

6. What personal qualities should a person have in order to relate and be of service to the Navajos?

7. Are these qualities the same for both Navajo and non-Navajo persons?

8. Where do you feel funds to operate a social service program should come from?

APPENDIX B

FISCAL YEAR - 1972

Month	General Assistance		Foster Care		Handicapped		Services
	No.	Amount	No.	Amount	No.	Amount	
July	7,430	1,332,204	43	2,730	195	41,135	1,399
August	7,650	1,349,168	47	2,215	226	45,652	1,431
September	7,700	1,304,586	47	2,335	290	67,728	1,508
October	7,808	1,307,853	45	2,920	318	69,868	1,581
November	7,977	1,277,574	49	2,738	324	67,011	1,583
December	7,792	1,293,665	44	2,372	320	53,233	1,605
January	7,576	1,283,384	47	2,200	329	61,824	1,652
February	7,966	1,317,553	48	2,683	332	64,630	1,644
March	8,023	1,346,541	44	2,239	346	68,290	1,634
April	8,326	1,328,062	53	2,457	348	60,973	1,554
May	8,008	1,269,139	69	2,938	319	61,522	1,493
June	7,849	1,326,239	44	2,294	316	50,290	1,543
Total	94,105	15,735,969	580	30,121	3,663	712,156	18,627

1972-73 Clothing - 419,650

Average General Assistance Cases per month	7,842
Average General Assistance Cost per month	$1,311,330
Average General Assistance Cost per Case per month	$167
Average Foster Care Cases per month	48
Average Foster Care Cost per month	$2,510
Average Foster Care Cost per Case per month	$42
Average Handicapped Cases per month	305
Average Handicapped Cost per month	$59,346
Average Handicapped Costs per Case per month	$194
Average Services Only Cases per month	1,552

Source: Bureau of Indian Affairs, Navajo Area Office